# Contents

**Introduction** — 1

0.1 What This Book Is About — 1  
0.2 Prologue to the First Chapter: A Very Short Introduction to Loisy’s Formative Years and Early Comparative Studies — 8

1 Comparative Religion and/as Modernist Theology: *L’Évangile et l’Église* and the *Neuilly Essais* — 16  
1.1 On the Interpretation of *L’Évangile et l’Église* — 20  
1.2 Comparative Religion in Adolf von Harnack’s *Das Wesen des Christentums* — 26  
1.3 *L’Évangile et l’Église* — 36  
1.3.1 Jesus and Judaism — 39  
1.3.2 Pagan Religion and the Development of Christian Doctrine and Cult — 45  
1.3.3 *L’Évangile et l’Église*: An Intermediate Conclusion — 56  
1.4 History of Religion or History of Religions? The *Essais* and the Firmin Article “La Religion d’Israël” — 57  
1.5 The Consequences for Loisy’s Position at the École pratique — 69

2 An Intricate Piece of Institutional History: The Elections for the Chair of History of Religions at the Collège de France (1908–1909) — 75  
2.1 On the Sources to Study the Elections and on the Election Procedures at the Collège — 78  
2.2 The Complex Methodological and Historical Context — 83  
2.2.1 Loisy’s Main Rivals — 83  
2.2.1.1 George Foucart — 83  
2.2.1.2 Jules Toutain — 85  
2.2.1.3 Maurice Vernes — 86  
2.2.1.4 Marcel Mauss — 87  
2.2.2 Loisy’s Scientific and Ideological Image in 1908 — 88  
2.2.3 From Historicism to Sociology, and the Social Question in Early 20th Century France — 90  
2.3 The Marquise Arconati-Visconti and Her *Jeudistes* — 96  
2.4 Loisy’s Appointment: Why and How? — 106  
2.4.1 Anticlericalism: Trump Card and Stumbling Block — 107  
2.4.2 Sociology Equals Socialism... — 120
2.4.3 “M. est israélite”: The Complex Role of Mauss’s Jewishness — 127
2.4.3.1 Salomon Reinach and the Jeudistes — 127
2.4.3.2 Reinach’s Ties with Durkheim and Mauss — 128
2.4.3.3 Philo-Semitism and Anti-Semitism in the Elections — 131
2.5 The Outcome — 138

3 Taking a Stand: Magic, Science, and Religion; History of Religions in the École laïque — 141
3.1 The Programmatic Inaugural Speech at the Collège de France (1909) — 145
3.2 Orpheus and the Bellum Orphicum — 151
3.2.1 Salomon Reinach: A Further Introduction — 152
3.2.2 The Origins of Religion According to Salomon Orpheus — 155
3.2.3 Loisy’s Main Criticisms — 165
3.3 Magic, Science, and Religion, or How Loisy Used Hubert and Mauss to Fight Frazer — 169
3.3.1 Magic and Religion — 171
3.3.2 Magic and Science — 176
3.3.3 Religion and Science: A Narrow Perspective — 178
3.3.4 The Emergence of the Religion de l’Humanité Concept — 182
3.4 History of Religions and the École laïque — 187

4 A Crack in the Historicist Wall: Myth Ritualism as a Weapon against the Christ Myth Theory — 195
4.1 The Christ Myth Theory in the Early 20th Century — 201
4.1.1 Arthur Drews’s Christus Mythe and the Professional Comparative Study of Early Christianity — 201
4.1.2 Jesus the Mock King: The Theories of Frazer and Reinach — 208
4.2 Loisy’s Historicist Struggle with the Christ Myth — 214
4.2.1 The Mock King Theory: Testimonies from the Loisy–Reinach Correspondence — 215
4.2.2 Fighting the Christ Myth: “Le Mythe du Christ” (1910) — 217
4.2.3 Towards a Theory of Myth: A Glance at Loisy’s Letters to Cumont — 223
4.3 Myth and Ritual in Les Mystères païens et le mystère chrétien (1913–1914) — 228
4.3.1 The Same but Not the Same — 229
4.3.2 Loisy’s Ritualist Theory of Myth: Between Science and Anti-Protestantism — 236
4.4 The Christ Myth Debates and the Professionalization of History of Religions —— 248
4.4.1 Paul-Louis Couchoud’s Mythological Project and Team —— 248
4.4.2 Histoire du christianisme Is Not Histoire des religions: Loisy’s Jubilé (1927) —— 253

5 Back to the Future: The Religion of Humanity and the History of Sacrifice —— 259
5.1 The War: Nationalist Christianities and the Universal Religion of Humanity —— 266
5.1.1 The Failures of Christianity: Protestant and Catholic —— 268
5.1.2 Christianity Historically Revised —— 274
5.2 Religion as Mystical Faith: La Religion (1917) —— 277
5.2.1 Faith, Religion, and Morality: An Indissoluble Link —— 278
5.2.2 Mysticism Versus Intellectualism and Sociology —— 282
5.2.3 The Religious History of Humanity —— 288
5.2.4 The Religious Future of Humanity and the Role of Sacrifice —— 291
5.3 Hybridity Reigning Supreme: The Essai historique sur le sacrifice (1920) —— 294
5.3.1 The Nature and Origin of Sacrifice —— 297
5.3.1.1 Loisy’s Explicit and Implicit Definition of Sacrifice —— 297
5.3.1.2 The Origin of Sacrifice —— 309
5.3.1.3 The Way Sacrifice Works (but Actually Doesn’t Work) —— 315
5.3.2 The History and the Future of Sacrifice —— 318

Conclusion —— 324

Bibliography —— 331

Unpublished sources —— 331
A) Bibliothèque nationale de France. Papiers Alfred Loisy—Correspondence —— 331
B) Bibliothèque de la Sorbonne—Victor Cousin. Correspondence received by the Marquise Arconati-Visconti, born Marie Peyrat —— 331
C) Bibliothèque Méjanes d’Aix-en-Provence. Fonds Salomon Reinach. Correspondence received by Reinach —— 332
D) Kasteel Van Gaasbeek. Correspondence by Marquise Arconati-Visconti —— 332
Published sources —— 332
Index of Modern Names — 356

Subject Index — 360