

Philippe Buc

Eschatologies of the Sword, Compared: Latin Christianity, Islam(s), and Japanese Buddhism

This chapter focuses on the role of eschatology in violence, across several ensembles, premodern catholic Christianity (with a focus on the First Crusade), medieval Japanese Buddhism, Twelver Imamite Shi'a Islam, and twelfth-century Almohad Mahdism. In particular, it looks at the impact of beliefs in the nature of the eschatological moment on the conduct of war, including intra-cultural war. These eschatologies assumed corruption and evil in the world. All these ensembles could trust that the eschatological moment called for the purge of evil, including in one's own ranks. The call for violent purge was exceptional in Japan, and limited to the Hokke School founded by Nichiren, likely because of both its eschatology and its intolerant exclusivism, which brings it close to medieval Catholicism and the aforementioned versions of Islam, in their refusal to accept the orthodoxy of other variants of the true religion.

[...] one must first learn to understand the time.
Nichiren, *The Selection of the Time*.¹

[...] The highest skill in matter of Scriptures [is] to
know how to distinguish between the times.
Bernhard Rothmann, *Von der Verborgenheit der Schrift des Reiches Christi*.²

What can a comparison between medieval Japan and medieval Catholic Europe, with an additional foray into classical and medieval Islams (plural),³ tell us about the role of eschatology (including apocalyptic expectations) in provoking, explaining, or shaping armed violence? Evidently, human beings do not need organised religion in order to wage war; nor is religion war's sole source of meaning or legitimacy. One should look at religion, rather, as one among several *Bedingungen der Möglichkeit*, "conditions of possibility", for war.⁴ One can also explore whether specific visions of the end push human beings to armed violence and provide scripts for it.⁵

1 Nichiren, *The Selection of the Time*, 538.

2 Rothmann, *Von Verborgenheit der Schrift des Reiches Christi*, 352.

3 The plural is obligatory given, at least, the divergence between Sunni and Shi'a Islam. But see also the *plaidoyer* in Al-Azmeh, *Islams and Modernities*.

4 For an explanation of the post-Kantian version of the term, see Blume, "Bedingung."

5 This is not the only possible effect of eschatology; see the comparative historical reflections in Landes, *Heaven on Earth*. For the concept of "scripts", see Baker and Edelstein, eds., *Scripting Revolution*.

In Western and Central European Christianity until perhaps as late as 1600, two normative scenarios co-existed when it came to the End Times. In the first, human beings would renounce armed violence and if necessary die as martyrs (in analogy to what the Church taught about apostolic and early Christian times). In the second, they would join the angelic armies of heaven and help the returning Christ purge the world of evil people and of sins. Commenting on John's Apocalypse, a biblical exegete likely active around the time of the First Crusade (1096–1100) leaned in the second direction:

*And the armies that are in heaven followed Him (Apoc. 19:14) [...] By the armies that John saw following Christ, and issuing from heaven, understand the saints who will be born at the end of the world and will fight against Antichrist.*⁶

According to some exegetes, the armies of heaven comprised the martyrs. These were the men and women whom the same Apostle John claimed to have seen in his vision clamoring to God, asking: How long shall you delay judging and avenging our blood on those who dwell on earth? (Apoc. 6:10: *Usquequo Domine sanctus et verus non iudicas et vindicas sanguinem nostrum de his qui habitant in terra?*) The theological consensus had it that this divine vengeance would take place at the end of time; but disagreement existed among commentators of the Bible as to whether the martyrs would themselves participate in the great bloody harvest of the impious. The idea of a waiting period, until the End, was not innocent; in the etymological sense of the word, it was not non-noxious: for it did not deny the virtue of purgative massacre, it just delayed its implementation, and kept it alive as a hope and value. The available scripts included the first two books of the Maccabees, which provided an oxymoronic alloy of passive and active martyrdom, melded together via the hot metal of vengeance. In 1 Maccabees, the family of Mattathias and Judas rose up in arms against pagan Greek oppressors and Jewish collaborators to avenge the blasphemies committed against the Jewish God. They died weapons in hand, but their cause met with success. One Eleazar threw his spear from under what he believed was the Greek ruler's elephant, and died under the dying beast's weight. He had thus "given himself [to death] to free his people and acquire an eternal renown" (1 Macc. 6:43–46). In 2 Maccabees (6–7), pious figures suffered passively for refusing to accept pagan practices, but God's vengeance struck their persecutors both miraculously (the tyrant Antiochus IV died a horrible death, 2 Macc. 9:5–28) and militarily (the heathen were massacred on the battlefield to avenge the martyrs, 2 Macc. 8:3–4). What linked this Old Testament past, the deeds of *vetus Israel*, the Israel of yore, to the present and the New (*novus*) or True (*verus*) Israel, that is, Christianity, was

⁶ Berengaudus, *Expositio in septem visiones*, 19.14, 926B. My thanks to Guy Lobrichon for this text.

typology and prophecy.⁷ Christian exegetes of the Bible considered that a number of figures in the Old (Jewish) Dispensation were types for entities or events in the Christian Era (the New Dispensation), or prophesied these. Thus the Maccabean fighters, for instance, were types for the *milites christi*, those men and women of the *verus Israel* soldiering for, or serving, Christ.⁸ And the genocidal fate of the enemies of the Israel of Old (depicted for instance in Isaiah) anticipated the destruction of Christianity's enemies at the end of time. These notions, developed in biblical exegesis, were displayed in the liturgy, which communicated them to the faithful at large.

Indeed, the liturgies commemorating martyrs, such as that for the children of 2 Maccabees 7, linked their willingness to die with the coming retribution at the end of time. This willingness drew on the Old Testament counterpart to the martyrs' clamor in Revelation, that is, on Psalm 78: "Avenge, O Lord, the blood of Your saints that has been shed."⁹

This liturgical juxtaposition, sung year after year as part of the calendar in Catholic churches remained for centuries just that – liturgical. Yet at one point it was – or so some Christians thought – enacted. With the First Crusade,¹⁰ the structure became event.¹¹ A critical mass of human beings had convinced itself that the apocalypse was just around the corner. The crusaders, in terms of Christian typology, were the New Israel, the New Maccabees. Their martyrdom, however, did not add to delayed vengeance, but triggered immediate retribution. One chronicler, himself a participant of the crusade, connected into a single sequence the martyrdom suffered by a number of Christian warriors before the walls of Antioch in 1098, and then, via the clamor of Revelation 6, the retributive massacre of the enemy Turks. According to the anonymous *Deeds of the Franks*, the latter's twelve leaders "died soul and body". A related version, that of Petrus Tudebodus, was even more explicit: all the enemies "received an eternal death [in hell] with the Devil and his angels".¹² According to another source, before storming Jerusalem in June 1099, the

7 Daniélou, *From Shadows to Reality*; Lubac, *Medieval Exegesis*. As to war, see Buc, *L'empreinte du Moyen Âge*. For an early study on the typological use of the Old Testament for political conceptions, see Chydenius, *Medieval Institutions and the Old Testament*.

8 Pace Lapina, *Warfare and the Miraculous in the Chronicles of the First Crusade*, for which see my review of it.

9 See, e.g., *Cantatorium*, fol. 125r (one of the oldest surviving Gregorian chant manuscripts, ca. 920); or Ms. Cod. Sang. 339, fol. 127v (antiphonary, ca. 980x1000). I am currently developing this relationship between the storming of Jerusalem and the liturgy, presented more at length at Giles Keppel and Mohammad Ali Amir-Moezzi's seminar, École Normale Supérieure, March 29, 2017's ENS seminar.

10 On the relationship between crusade and liturgy, see now Gaposchkin's superb *Invisible Weapons*.

11 See Sahlins, *Islands of History*, and *How "Natives" think*.

12 *Gesta Francorum et aliorum Hierosolimitanorum*, § 8, ed. and trans. Hill, 40–42; Petrus Tudebodus, *Historia de Hierosolymitano itinere*, eds. Hill and Hill, 74–77.

crusaders did not only imitate the script of the “Israel of Old” (their typological exemplar) against Jericho via a procession around the city’s wall. They also spent the night reciting psalms and the litanies of the saints, among which one recognises elements of the vengeful liturgy for the martyrs.¹³ And the same author, depicting the mounds of slaughtered “pagan” bodies after the crusaders’ conquest of the Holy City, saw in this landscape poetic divine justice. Did the situation not invert the verses of the psalm (*uersa uice [...] mutato*), “They laid the corpses of Your enemies to be fodder for the birds of the air, the flesh of Your opponents [to be fodder] for the beasts of the earth?”¹⁴ The original Psalm 78:2 read: “They have given the corpses of Your servants to be fodder for the birds of the air, the flesh of Your saints [to be fodder] for the beats of the earth.” The liturgies enacted right after the conquest of Jerusalem also echoed those for the martyrs.¹⁵

The actualisation of these specific biblical scenarios came about because one reached a tipping point (the moment when an accumulation of elements, which accumulation had up until then not changed dynamics, brutally engenders a wholly new process):¹⁶ a critical mass of men and women had convinced itself before or during the crusading expedition of 1096–1099 that the world stood on the threshold of history’s end, the Eschaton.¹⁷ That the First Crusade was moved in part by apocalypticism is controversial among scholars, but is made more likely by a similar configuration obtaining in more fully documented episodes of paroxysmal religious violence, such as the Taborite holy war against “soft” Catholicism in 1419 to 1421, the radical French Catholic attempts to exterminate Calvinism from the 1560s to the 1580s, and the Anabaptist takeover of the Westphalian city of Münster in 1534/1535.¹⁸ Despite scholarly skepticism, therefore, the probability is high that many participants of the crusade in 1096–1100 were enacting a vision of the End, an apocalyptic script transmitted by the Bible, its interpretations, and the liturgy. One cannot

13 See *The Text of the Account of the Capture of Jerusalem*, ed. France, 647. France remarks, n. 9, on the echo of Psalm 78.

14 *The Text of the Account of the Capture of Jerusalem*, ed. France, 650: *Et uersa uice nonne mutato de his dici potest: ‘Posuerunt morticina inimicorum tuorum escas uolatilibus celi, carnes aduersariorum tuorum bestiis terre’. Nam sed merito non erat qui sepeliret. Congruum namque [...].*

15 See Raymond d’Aguilers, *Le “Liber” de Raymond d’Aguilers*, ed. Hill and Hill, 151: *Quomodo plaudebant exultantes et cantantes canticum novum Domino [...] Hęc dies quam fecit Dominus, exultemus et letemur in ea*, compared to Cod. Sang. 339, fol. 127r–v: *Offertorium]. Exultabunt sancti in gloria laetabuntur in cubilibus suis exultationes dei in faucibus eorum. V[ersus]. Cantate domino canticum nouum cantate domino canticum nouum laus ei in ecclesia sanctorum [...].*

16 “Tipping point” or “tip point”, a natural science concept brought into Sociology by Grodzins, “Metropolitan Segregation.”

17 Lobrichon, *1099. Jérusalem conquise*; Flori, *La Guerre sainte*, 347–352; Buc, “La vengeance de Dieu;” Rubenstein, *Armies of Heaven*.

18 I have brought together these four moments in Buc, *Holy War, Martyrdom, and Terror*, to show the similarities in the shape that armed violence took. The classic study linking the sense of the coming End with radical Catholic religious warfare is by Denis Crouzet, *Les guerriers de Dieu*. See as well Norman Housley, *Religious Warfare in Europe*.

explain the willingness and desire on the part of tens of thousands of men and women to journey from Western Europe all the way to the Near East without apocalypticism. And perhaps more interestingly, one cannot understand what they did and speculate on what they may have felt – their deeds and conceptions – without knowing the scripts for the End of Days current in late eleventh-century Western Europe.

The beginnings of Islam were eschatological, as the Qur'an's frequent references to the Last Days (*ākhir az-zamān*) indicate. A number of scholars have convincingly argued that the Prophet saw himself as living in the End Times, entrusted with the task to renew and purify monotheism.¹⁹ The relationship of the earliest community around Muḥammad to armed violence may have been complicated (which would account for the seeming contradictions in the several traditions about the legality of violence, its limitations and the forms it could take).²⁰ But whatever early Muslim radical pacifism, including the willingness to be martyred rather than fight, may have existed in the first generation of what Aziz Al-Azmeh has felicitously conceptualised as “Paleo-Islam”,²¹ it did not become normative outside Shi'a and related traditions.

Twelver Imamite Shi'ism, from which the currently dominant form of Islam in today's Iran derives, provides an interesting point of comparison with medieval Catholic Christianity.²² Mathieu Terrier has recently shown how Twelver eschatology abolished active religious warfare and instead called for martyrdom in the current age of history; in the End Times, however, warfare will again be permissible and necessary to combat the Muslim Antichrist (the Dajjal or Djaddjāl, “deceiver”), a false Messiah. This last war will be led by the returning hidden Imam, the Mahdī, assisted by the Prophet Jesus. 'Alī's refusal to fight for his rights as successor to his cousin Muḥammad was based on the Prophet's injunction not to go to war until one had enough men on one's side to win. This happened at the battle of Siffin (657),

¹⁹ Blichfeldt, *Early Mahdism*, has little to say on eschatology. But see Donner, “From Believers to Muslims;” Filiu, *Apocalypse in Islam*, with the review by Derry, “Review of the *Apocalypse in Islam*;” Shoemaker, *The Death of a Prophet*, and Shoemaker, “‘The Reign of God Has Come’;” Arjomand, “Messianism, Millennialism and Revolution in Early Islamic History.”

²⁰ Firestone, *Jihad*.

²¹ Al-Azmeh, *The Emergence of Islam in Late Antiquity*. One will disagree with Bowersock, *The Crucible of Islam*, iii, that Al-Azmeh's “attempt to rename the early Islamic period as Paleo-Islam will probably not succeed in altering current usage”. No matter that Bowersock, according to his Princeton flatmate Peter Brown, “has now thoroughly outpaced” Edward Gibbon, see Brown's review, “The Center of a Roiling World,” at 48.

²² This paragraph summarises Terrier, “Expérience et représentation du *Jihād* dans le Shi'isme imamite ancien.” I am grateful to Dr Terrier for a preview of this text before its publication, on the occasion of our common presentation at Keppel and Amir-Moezzi's ENS seminar, March 29, 2017. See as well Amanat, *Apocalyptic Islam and Iranian Shi'ism*, hard to use given the lack of diachronic markers.

which 'Ali fought against the supporters of Mu'āwiyya. However, due to deceit and the timorousness of many of 'Ali's warriors, Mu'āwiyya became the fifth Caliph. The family of the Prophet suffered a final defeat at Karbalā' (680 CE), where 'Ali's second son Hussayn and much of Hussayn's family were massacred. After Karbalā', for Twelver Islam, there was to be no more fighting for God, but mere passive martyrdom. The angelic hosts who might have fought (but failed) to protect Hussayn are now mournfully awaiting the Last Days. It is in these Last Days that the twelfth Imam will return as the "master of the time" to avenge the Shi'a from the persecutions they suffered – passively – since the beginning. Shi'a traditions also teach that some saintly martyrs will return to life in order to fight – as some apocalyptically-minded crusaders believed their own martyred dead did in 1098–1099, alongside the angelic hosts (as Saint Andrew explained in a vision).²³

Like the Jewish Essenes (or whatever Jewish sect penned the manuscripts of Qumran)²⁴ and like the singers of the Catholic liturgy ca. 1000, the Imamite Shi'a trusted in a delayed vengeance. For the Twelvers, as for some medieval Christians (and for the Jewish sectarians), there would be a holy war to end all sufferings, but its time had not yet come. This comparison thus reveals that what one could read as pacifism (in the contemporary sense of the term) in the medieval sources was not necessarily that: it was waiting for the vengeance at the end of time, for an eschatological vengeance in which, in some scenarios, the elect would take part.

A connection between eschatology and radical violence is attested elsewhere in the vast world and history of Islam, or rather of Islams, plural. In the twelfth and thirteenth century, the Almohads, a reformist movement, emerged in North Africa.²⁵ They considered their first and most critical task to be the fight against the established dynasty of the Almoravids, who in their eyes propagated a deviant version of Islam. The Almohad movement had been founded by a Mahdī, Ibn Tūmart (d. ca. 1128/1130), one of many Mahdīs who emerged in the Islamic West, the Maghreb, between the eighth and the fifteenth century. To what extent these figures were compatible with Sunni orthodoxy is beside the point (one can debate the influence of

²³ Raymond d'Aguilers, *Le "Liber" de Raymond d'Aguilers*, ed. Hill and Hill, 78, American trans. by Hill and Hill, *Historia Francorum Qui Ceperunt Iherusalem*, 60 (modified): "And in truth God shall help you. All your brothers who died since the journey's beginning shall join with you, and you shall fight [only] one tenth of the enemy, since they, in the power of God and at His command shall fight against nine tenth of the enemy." On Raymond, see Flori, *Croniqueurs et propagandistes*; Buc, *Holy War, Martyrdom, and Terror*, 152–176, and passim.

²⁴ I discuss the Essenes in Buc, *Holy War, Martyrdom, and Terror*, 69–70, where I follow those scholars who see a connection between the sect and the Qumran manuscripts. Those who deny this connection will still have to agree that a Jewish sect believed in dissimulating hatred for the impious until the war of the Just, the Angels, and God, against bad Jews and pagans. Whether we call this sect Essene or not is irrelevant to the comparison. Some scholars see a connection between the Qumran scrolls and early Muslim apocalypticism, see Arjomand, "Messianism, Millennialism and Revolution in Early Islamic History," 109–111.

²⁵ See Lagardère "Gihād almohade," 2.617–631.

Shi'a and Sufi ideas in the little that one can reconstruct of these usually ephemeral figures' teachings).²⁶ With Mahdism, we observe a configuration, also present in several Christian episodes, that conjoins End Times expectations, reform, and purge of one's own ranks. The Mahdī Ibn Tūmart (or one of his lieutenants) forced the leaders of Muslim Berber tribes to identify in their own groups lukewarm followers of the new movement in their own groups, and to execute them.²⁷ The episode is known thanks to Abu Bakr al-Baydak, a companion of the Mahdī, and was later seen as an embarrassment.²⁸ "They were put to death, each by his fellow tribesmen", reported from the distant Mashreq, the Muslim "East", a partisan of the rival Ayyubids, Ibn al-Athir (1160–1233). Another version of the story, also transmitted by Ibn al-Athir, pushed the blame away from the Mahdī and onto an impostor, Abu Muhammad 'Abdallāh al-Bashir al-Wansharisi. Al-Bashir latter claimed that God had granted him the ability to know who was destined to heaven and who a reprobate (i.e., predestined to damnation). The Berbers were then ordered to spare the former and execute the latter.²⁹ Al-Baydak presents the first of two purges as the "sorting out (*tamyīz*) of the [Almohad] party". All "those who were dissenting, hypocrites, or false" were excluded: "Thus the perfidious were sorted out from the good. People then beheld with their own eyes the truth, and the believers' faith was doubled. As for the unjust, they tasted the fire [...] Then al-Bashir reviewed the survivors and went on expedition with God's benediction."³⁰

This account finds a surprising parallel in a vision reported by the most apocalyptically-minded of all First Crusade chroniclers, Raymond d'Aguilers. In 1098, Peter Bartholomew was told by Christ in a vision to let the crusader army assemble as if for review. Once the battle-cry, "Help, O God", had been shouted, the Saviour would highlight any traitors within the ranks. They were to be slaughtered and their goods distributed to the poor. Only so, said the Lord, would the army reach its desired aim, Jerusalem. It was a vision, and a vision that was not enacted. But the desire to purge one's own ranks existed all the same.³¹ One purged insiders; one more evidently purged outsiders. Returning to the Maghreb, Maribel Fierro has surmised that eschatology may have been one of the five possible reasons why the Almohads decided to force Christians and Jews to convert to Islam, in a departure from the routine toleration of the "people of the Book" as long as they submitted to Islam's

²⁶ García-Arenal, *Messianism and Puritanical Reform*, and García-Arenal, *Mahdisme et millénarisme en Islam*.

²⁷ See García-Arenal, *Messianism and Puritanical Reform*, 171–173.

²⁸ My thanks to Pascal Buresi for the information and for drawing my attention to this source: Al-Baydak, *Mémoires*, ed. Lévi-Provençal, 126–127, 181–185.

²⁹ Ibn al-Athir, *Annales du Maghreb et de l'Espagne*, trans. Fagnan, 532–535.

³⁰ Al-Baydak, *Mémoires*, ed. Lévi-Provençal, 126–127 (French), 181–185 (Arabic). On this episode, see Arjomand, *Apocalypse and Social Revolution in Islam*, chapters 7 and 8. I thank him for the preview.

³¹ See Buc, *Holy War, Martyrdom, and Terror*, 168–69; Rubenstein, "Godfrey of Bouillon versus Raymond of Saint-Gilles," 67–69.

political rule.³² Would not at the end, as proper for a universalist faith, all humans be one? Fierro adduces comparable cases, including that of the famous Shi'a Fatimid Caliph al-Hakim, who too may have been moved by eschatology to persecute Jews and Christians in ca. 1009 (corresponding to Hijra 400). Another factor she proposes is the Almohad obsession with the oneness of truth – an obsession always present as a potential within universalist religions.³³

The motif of betrayal and enemy trickery is present in Muslim eschatology, as it is in its older Christian cousin.³⁴ In Christianity, the Antichrist, lieutenant of Satan – the “father of lies” (John 8:44) – is the lie (*mendacium*) par excellence (2 Thess. 2:10–12).³⁵ The name of his Muslim equivalent, the Dajjal, means straightforwardly “the deceiver”.³⁶ Both Christianity and Islam consequently assume that it is desirable towards the end of time to know who is actually in the righteous camp, and who is not. Dislike for false brothers can lead to extreme solutions such as those propounded by both the Mahdī Ibn Tūmart and Raymond d’Aguilers’s first crusade circle of visionaries. Furthermore, both Christianity and Islam assume that at the End, only a minority among the nominal believers will be true; both thus also predict internal wars (Arabic *fitna*) to take place in the End Times, in which true believers will be sorted from the bad. These wars will offer men and women the choice to join the right side. In this way, the community of believers will be “refined”.³⁷ Tellingly, in the first five centuries of Sunni Islam, the “Book of *fitna*”, *Kitāb al-*fitan**, was the preferred title for apocalyptic literature.³⁸

The newest “kid on the block” Daesh, a.k.a. the “Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (or Syria)”, ISIL (or ISIS), also pairs intense apocalyptic notions with the idea of purging the Muslim community of false believers. The sect’s propaganda magazine, *Dabiq* (published until recently and in several languages), and its follow-up, *Rumiyah*, juxtapose discourse about the coming final battles against Satanic Western armies with violent images of the execution of infidels and bad Muslims.³⁹ As my MA student Lukas Huber has explored, like many crusade-era thinkers, the

32 Fierro, “A Muslim Land without Jews or Christians,” 242–243, and Fierro, “Conversion, Ancestry and Universal Religion.”

33 Fierro, “A Muslim Land without Jews or Christians,” 246.

34 See here Cook, *Studies in Muslim Apocalyptic*, 16–17.

35 This notion linking Antichrist and deceit remains central up to the modern day, as evidenced by the plot of the highly popular apocalyptic series *Left Behind*, published in the late 1990s and early 2000s. See Buc, “Evangelical Fundamentalist Fiction and Medieval Crusade Epics.”

36 Blichfeldt, *Early Mahdism*, 5.

37 In the episode discussed above, Saint Andrew compares the chosen crusaders to good grain sorted away from straw (destined to be burnt) and also to noble metal.

38 Cook, *Studies in Muslim Apocalyptic*, 15–16, 20–22, 27.

39 I draw here on the fine MA thesis of my student Huber, “The Eternal Crusader.”

Daesh publications assume the existence of a conspiracy uniting multiple agents, including the obvious “crusaders” (infidel soldiers) and traitors.⁴⁰

To call Japan Buddhist is a simplification. Like elsewhere in East Asia, Buddhism in Japan has always coexisted with local cults and Confucianism.⁴¹ However, it dominated the islands’ institutional religious landscape. A consensus emerged in the eleventh century among the different schools or lineages present in medieval Japan that one lived in the terminal phase of a cycle of the Buddhist Law. One had entered the *mappō* – a dangerous age in which demonic forces roamed and corruption was rife, including among monks.⁴² Demons might corrupt Buddhist teachings and inspire sinful and nefarious falsehoods. A dangerous age called for radical measures. The Japanese schools of Buddhism, however, stopped short of promoting holy war against sects they considered to have veered away from correct teachings.⁴³ The school that came closest to doing so, the Hokke-Shū founded by Nichiren (1222–1282),⁴⁴ considered that in this last age only its own teachings and the exclusive devotional focus on just one sutra (the Lotus Sutra) could ensure salvation. Nichiren, in 1260, also held that in an earlier age, kings and others had earned karma and reincarnations as *buddhas* by fighting against Brahmins and bad monks – if necessary, to the death. But – and we shall return to this – with the present age opened by Shakyamuni *buddha*, one no longer was to kill bad monks; it sufficed to withdraw alms from them.⁴⁵ A few years after this statement, however, Nichiren, perhaps because the threat of a Mongol invasion had become more acute, wrote that the only way to save the realm was to round up monks from the Zen school and the Pure Land schools, and behead them all on a beach. This was not an idle pronouncement: Nichiren claimed it was not his own, but “rather it was in all cases the spirit of the Thus Come One Shakyamuni that had taken possession of my body”.⁴⁶ Nichiren assumed that in this last age, the most dangerous enemies of the Law were not “evil rulers and evil ministers, [...] non-Buddhists and devil kings”. The main groups of the “enemies of the correct teachings” comprised “monks who disobey the precepts”, but the greatest of them were the “slanders of the law [...] among

40 McCants, *The ISIS Apocalypse*, describes a tension between the eschatological impulse and the need to organise that specialists of the European Middle Ages will recognise: A king at the end of time was often both a builder and reformer and an apocalyptic figure.

41 Bowring, *Religious Traditions of Japan*.

42 See Marra, “The Development of Mappō Thought in Japan.” Marra considers that with the fourteenth century, *mappō* was no longer feared, and if still believed in, acted upon.

43 See in general Demiéville, “Le Bouddhisme et la guerre,” repr. in Demiéville, *Choix d’études bouddhiques*. This classic discussion has been translated as “Buddhism and War.”

44 Stone, *Original Enlightenment and the Transformation of Medieval Japanese Buddhism*.

45 Stone, “Rebuking the Enemies of the Lotus.” See the *Risshō ankoku ron*, translated in English as *Establishing the Correct Teaching*, 19.

46 Letter of 1271, which Nichiren cites in his *The Selection of the Time*, 579.

the eminent monks, who appear to be upholders of the precepts and men of wisdom". They were all the more dangerous as they were hard to identify as enemies, even harder to unmask than corrupt monks.⁴⁷ In medieval Catholic conceptions, too, the Antichrist's most effective agents were not pagans or the kings who persecuted Christians; rather, they were deviant Christians and "false Christians" (to use the terms of the twelfth-century *Ludus de Antichristo* ("Play of Antichrist"), that is, heretics and hypocrites. These would emerge in abundance right before the coming of the end, as members of the Antichrist.⁴⁸ From this belief emerged what seems a European collective paranoia, a character trait still visible in some quarters nowadays, that is, the assumption of gigantic conspiracies to overthrow what is good, and sow evil.⁴⁹ Present but more relaxed perhaps in the medieval Japanese context, this belief in organised treachery exists also in Islam.

Nichiren considered that "when it comes to studying the teachings of Buddhism, one must first understand the time". Less radical figures agreed that the moment mattered, such as for instance the Tendai abbot Jien (d. 1225), scion of the great Fujiwara family that had produced imperial regents since the eighth century. Jien criticised the newer, demotic Amidist schools of Japanese Buddhism that promised a simple path to salvation, which stood in stark contrast to the more complicated practices of the Tendai and Shingon forms of Buddhism. He attributed antinomian ideas (that one could eat meat and have sex and yet be reborn) to the Amidists and rebuked them. Jien was especially upset at the claim made by Hōnen (d. 1212),⁵⁰ that a simple focus on the Buddha Amida (Japanese Amitābha) and the invocation of his name alone ensured salvation. Yet he curiously admitted that in a later phase of the Buddhist time-cycle, a single-minded focus on the Buddha Amida would be the solution:

At a time when the one teaching of Amitabha will really increase divine grace, people will certainly have their sins and troubles removed and enter paradise. But before that time comes, and while the Shingon and the eliminate-illusion teachings of Tendai are still destined to prosper, no one will be able to achieve salvation by following the teachings of deceptive demons.

Jien, like many of his contemporaries, believed that he lived in the last, degenerate age of a Buddhist cycle, the *mappō*, but he trusted that humans could set back tem-

⁴⁷ Nichiren, *The Selection of the Time*, 584.

⁴⁸ *Ludus de Antichristo*, ed. Vollmann-Profe. For Antichrist, crusade, and eschatology, see most recently Buc, "Crusade and Eschatology." In general, see most recently the multivolume study by Potestà and Rizzi, eds., *L'anticristo*.

⁴⁹ See Buc, *Holy War, Martyrdom, and Terror*, 246–247, and the discussion of paranoia and hysteria, 112–151.

⁵⁰ See Bowring, *Religious Traditions of Japan*, 245–253.

porarily its effects. The time for a single-minded focus on just a single devotion had not yet come.⁵¹

In relation to religious armed violence, time had a peculiar texture. Ages in which it was allowed, or even mandated, were followed by periods when it was forbidden, and *vice versa*. The influential Church Father, Augustine of Hippo (d. 430), had to justify why the self-styled “Catholic” Church could call on the Roman army to force the so-called Donatist dissenters to listen to Catholic sermons. How could this be permitted when the Church, until recently, had been persecuted by the same Roman state? Was not any Christian church founded on the blood of the martyrs, hallowed by the violent persecution they had endured? In several of his works, the good bishop deployed the same argument to rebuff such challenges. With the Roman emperors’ conversion to Christianity in the fourth century, the Psalm’s prophecy had been fulfilled. In an earlier age, the kings of this earth had raged against the Church. Now, however, they served it (Ps. 2). This was according to God’s will and called for new rules. Augustine’s eschatology, as is well known, was consciously anti-millenarian.⁵² But with this argument of the turning of times, he nailed shut the coffin of early Christian pacifism. Seven hundred years later, the monk Ekkehard of Aura, who by contrast with Augustine believed he stood at the threshold of the apocalypse,⁵³ hit out with a counter-accusation at the critiques levied at the unprecedented pilgrimage in arms that was the First Crusade. Those opposed to the crusade were, Ekkehard argued, “unwise” and “impudent” men, stuck in an obsolete (*inveterata*) error. They did not realise that this “novelty [the crusade]” was “so necessary for a world that has now grown old and is close to its end”.⁵⁴ The opposition between the old (*inveterata*) and the new (*novum*), set in the context of the End Times, made logical the transvaluation (*Umwertung*) of an earlier value: just as the New Testament had turned the Old Testament’s bellicism into pacifism, the apocalyptic moment turned on its head the old teachings of the Church forbidding offensive holy war. Scrutinising sky, nature, and politics for the signs listed in the “little apocalypse” of Matthew 24, and detailing their factual presence in his chronicle, Ekkehard, like many others, had come to believe that the Last Days had arrived. Over the centuries, many Christians and Muslims would both scrutinise for signs of the End and see signs of the End.⁵⁵

51 Jien, *The Future and the Past*, ed. and trans. Brown and Ichida, 171–173. Jien believed Japan had entered the *mappō* (*The Future and the Past*, 223, with the editors’ footnote 43), but his notion of history included the possibility to resist the decline, if only for a limited number of years.

52 Landes, “Millenarismus Absconditus.”

53 Buc, “Crusade and Eschatology,” 301–313; Rubenstein, “Crusade and Apocalypse,” 180–186, and Rubenstein, *Nebuchadnezzar’s Dream*.

54 Ekkehard, *Frutolfs und Ekkehards Chroniken*, eds. Schmale and Schmale-Ott, 130.

55 Examples of Japanese Buddhist signs in Nichiren, *The Selection of the Time*, 576–577, include false and evil monks, aberrant stellar motions, great winds, rains and fires, internal strife, conflict among kin, armed revolt, invasions. See also Nichiren, *On Establishing the Correct Teaching for the*

The sense of reversals was not present only in Abrahamic monotheisms. In the *Treatise on the State*, a work in dialogic form involving a questioning Visitor and an answering Master, Nichiren justified coercion of bad monks by invoking earlier cycles of the Buddhist Law, the *dharma*. Back then, kings and warriors had gained merit by killing evil Brahmins to protect the Law: they had also fought bad monks, sometimes to the death, and with karmic rewards. The Buddha Shakyamuni was the reincarnation of one of these armed sectarians.⁵⁶ At this point in the dialogue, the reader, along with the fictional Visitor interrogating the Master, might come to the conclusion that this legitimised the killing of bad monks. The Master seemed to be leading the discussion in this direction. Yet his teaching then takes a surprising turn. In the current age of the Dharma incepted by Shakyamuni, one is no longer to kill bad monks, one just refuses alms to them.⁵⁷ Nichiren would change his mind about this less than ten years later, owing to the growing Mongol threat, which for him was both a consequence of religious failings and an occasion for religious reform. Nevertheless, in his division of ages one can see something akin to the Christian ideas about a time before and another after Christ, whose Passion marked the passage from the material warfare waged by the Old Israel to the merely spiritual warfare of the New Israel, Christianity.⁵⁸

Conclusion

Let us end on presentist musings, whose speculative nature should not invalidate the preceding comparisons. In a wonderful flight of Gallic rhetoric, the mid-nineteenth-century historian Edgard Quinet, meditating on the Christian nature of the unchristian French Revolution, turned to a comparison that explained the zealous mutual antagonism of Islam and Europe:

Peace of the Land, 8–10. For Muslim signs of the End, see Cook, *Studies in Muslim Apocalyptic*, 13–14.

⁵⁶ Nichiren, *On Establishing the Correct Teaching for the Peace of the Land*, 19–23. See the French translation, Nichiren, *Le “Traité sur l’État” de Nichiren*, trans. Renondeau, 166–174.

⁵⁷ Nichiren, *On Establishing the Correct Teaching for the Peace of the Land*, 23; Nichiren, *Le “Traité sur l’État” de Nichiren*, trans. Renondeau, 174. Refusing alms means institutional murder. A temple could not survive without support.

⁵⁸ Interestingly, Nichiren, like Jien, considered that the present age was the age of the warriors. Jien presented the idea neutrally; Nichiren, *On Establishing the Correct Teaching for the Peace of the Land*, 21, was more positive: it was now, given the *mappō* (“if the correct teaching is about to come to an end”) and the resulting existence of bad monks, the task of the warriors (“white-robed laymen”) to defend the Law “with swords and staves”. However, they should not “take life”.

East and West had aimed in their struggles at the same thing. With the same violence, the one as the other wanted the unity promised by the prophets, the founders of their respective laws. Furthermore, they were moved by the same force, fear. When I consider Muḥammad or Gregory VII, I see the same terror for the Last Day, the same tremor that propels two worlds the one against the other: They make haste because they believe that they are at the edge of their last instant. On both sides, a fearsome angel pushes them to the same clash, and the same force is paralyzed by its opposite.⁵⁹

An analogous meeting of End Time beliefs and pressures took place with the monstrous virtual encounter between Osama bin Laden and George W. Bush in and around September 11 (2001).⁶⁰ Bruce Lincoln famously juxtaposed the two warlords' speeches, and (among other mirrored dimensions) identified encoded apocalyptic references.⁶¹ In a global world, where in the USA a good quarter of the population belongs to fundamentalist protestant denominations and believes in Armageddon, and where the majority of Muslims also now see themselves as living in or close to the end of time, we cannot dismiss the force of seemingly archaic scripts that link the apocalypse and violence.

Bibliography

Abbreviations

- CCCM Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis. Turnhout: Brepols, 1966–.
 CCSL Corpus Christianorum Series Latina. Turnhout: Brepols, 1953–.
 CSEL Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1866–.
 PL Patrologiae cursus completus, series Latina, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne, 221 vols. Paris, 1844–1855, 1862–1865.
 SC Sources Chrétiennes. Paris: Éd. du Cerf, 1941–.

Manuscripts Cited

Antiphonary. Ms. Cod. Sang. 339, Stiftsbibliothek Sankt Gallen.

Cantatorium. Ms. Cod. Sang. 359, Stiftsbibliothek Sankt Gallen.

⁵⁹ Quinet, *Christianisme et la révolution française*, 209.

⁶⁰ I mean, of course, *à tout seigneur tout honneur* (cf. Romans 13.7), September 11th, 2001, with its close to 3000 casualties, not September 11th, 1973, when the Chilean army overthrew with CIA help President Allende, resulting in the execution of thousands of Chilean leftists.

⁶¹ Lincoln, *Thinking About Religion After September 11*, 19–32 (“Symmetric Dualisms: Bush and bin Laden on October 7”).

Primary Sources

- Al-Baydak. *Mémoires*. In *Documents inédits d'histoire almohade. Fragments manuscrits du "Legajo" 1919 du fonds arabe de l'Escorial*, edited and translated by Évariste Lévi-Provençal, 75–224. Paris: Geuthner, 1928.
- Berengaudus, *Expositio in septem visiones libri Apocalypsis*. In PL 17, 765–970C. Paris: Imprimerie Catholique, 1844–1855.
- Ekkehard. *Frotolfs und Ekkehards Chroniken und die anonyme Kaiserchronik*. Edited by Franz-Josef Schmale and Irene Schmale-Ott. Vol. 15, *Ausgewählte Quellen zur deutschen Geschichte des Mittelalters*. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1972.
- Gesta Francorum et aliorum Hierosolimitanorum – The Deeds of the Franks and the Other Pilgrims to Jerusalem*. Edited and translated by Rosalind Hill. London: Nelson, 1962.
- Ibn al-Athir. *Annales du Maghreb et de l'Espagne*. Translated by Edmond Fagnan. Algiers: Éditions Grand Alger Livres, 1898.
- Jien. *The Future and the Past. A Translation and Study of the Gukanshō, an Interpretive History of Japan Written in 1219*. Edited and translated by Delmer Brown and Ichirō Ichida. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979.
- Ludus de Antichristo*. Edited by Gisela Vollmann-Profe. 2 vols. Vol. 82, *Litterae*. Göppingen: Kümmerle, 1981.
- Nichiren. *On Establishing the Correct Teaching for the Peace of the Land*. In *The Writings of Nichiren Daishonin*, edited by the Soka Gakkai, 6–30. 2 vols. Tokyo: Soka Gakkai, 2003.
- Nichiren. *The Selection of the Time*. In *The Writings of Nichiren Daishonin*, edited by the Soka Gakkai, 538–594. 2 vols. Tokyo: Soka Gakkai, 2003.
- Nichiren. *Le "Traité sur l'État" de Nichiren, suivi de huit lettres de 1268*. Translated by George Renondeau. *T'oung Pao*, 2nd ser., 40, no. 3 (1950): 123–198.
- Petrus Tudebodus. *Historia de Hierosolymitano itinere*. Edited by John Hugh Hill and Laurita L. Hill. Vol. 12, *Documents relatifs à l'histoire des croisades*. Paris: Geuthner, 1977.
- Raymond d'Aguilers. *Le "Liber" de Raymond d'Aguilers. Historia Francorum qui ceperunt Iherusalem*. Edited by John Hugh Hill and Laurita L. Hill. Vol. 9, *Documents relatifs à l'histoire des croisades*. Paris: Geuthner, 1969.
- Raymond d'Aguilers. *Historia Francorum qui ceperunt Iherusalem*. Translated by John Hugh Hill and Laurita L. Hill. Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1968.
- Rothmann, Bernhard. *Von Verborgenheit der Schrift*. In *Die Schriften Bernhard Rothmanns*, edited by Robert Stupperich, 299–372. Vol. 1, *Die Schriften der münsterischen Täufer und ihrer Gegner*. Münster: Aschendorff, 1970.
- The Text of the Account of the Capture of Jerusalem in the Ripoll Manuscript, Bibliothèque Nationale (Latin) 5132*. Edited by John France. *English Historical Review* 103, no. 3 (1988): 640–657.

Secondary Literature

- Al-Azmeh, Aziz. *Islams and Modernities*. London: Verso, 2009.
- Al-Azmeh, Aziz. *The Emergence of Islam in Late Antiquity: Allah and His People*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Amanat, Abbas. *Apocalyptic Islam and Iranian Shi'ism*. Vol. 4, *Library of Modern Religion*. London: I. B. Tauris, 2009.

- Arjomand, Said Amir. "Messianism, Millennialism and Revolution in Early Islamic History." In *Imagining the End: Visions of Apocalypse from the Ancient Middle East to Modern America*, edited by Abbas Amanat and Magnus Thorkell Bernhardsson, 106–125. London: I. B. Tauris, 2002.
- Arjomand, Said Amir. *Apocalypse and Social Revolution in Islam: The Hour is Neigh and the Moon is Split*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, forthcoming.
- Baker, Keith Michael, and Dan Edelstein, eds. *Scripting Revolution. A Historical Approach to the Comparative Study of Revolutions*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2015.
- Blichfeldt, Jan-Olaf. *Early Mahdism. Politics and Religion in the Formative Period of Islam*. Leiden: Brill, 1985.
- Blume, Thomas. "Bedingung." In *Handwörterbuch der Philosophie*, edited by Wulff D. Rehfus, 268–269. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2003.
- Bowersock, Glen W. *The Crucible of Islam*. Cambridge/Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2017.
- Bowring, Richard. *The Religious Traditions of Japan 500–1600*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Brown, Peter. "At the Center of a Roiling World." *New York Review of Books* 64, no. 8 (2017): 48–50.
- Buc, Philippe. "La vengeance de Dieu. De l'exégèse patristique à la réforme ecclésiastique et à la première croisade." In *La vengeance, 400–1200*, edited by Dominique Barthélemy, François Bougard and Régine Le Jean, 451–486. Vol. 357, Collection de l'École française de Rome. Rome: École Française de Rome, 2006.
- Buc, Philippe. *L'empreinte du Moyen Âge: La guerre sainte*. Avignon: Presses Universitaires d'Avignon, 2011.
- Buc, Philippe. *Holy War, Martyrdom, and Terror. Christianity, Violence, and the West*. Philadelphia: Pennsylvania University Press, 2015.
- Buc, Philippe. "Crusade and Eschatology: Holy War Fostered and Inhibited." *Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung* 125, no. 2 (2017): 304–339.
- Buc, Philippe. Review of *Warfare and the Miraculous in the Chronicles of the First Crusade*, by Elizabeth Lapina. *Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung* 125, no. 2 (2017): 445–447.
- Buc, Philippe. "Evangelical Fundamentalist Fiction and Medieval Crusade Epics." *Cahiers de Recherches Médiévales et Humanistes* 37, no. 1 (2019): 189–209.
- Chydenius, Johannes. *Medieval Institutions and the Old Testament*. Vol. 37/2, Commentationes humanarum litterarum. Helsinki: Societas Scientiarum Fennica, 1965.
- Cook, David. *Studies in Muslim Apocalyptic*. Vol. 21, Studies in Late Antiquity and Early Islam. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002.
- Crouzet, Denis. *Les guerriers de Dieu. La violence au temps des troubles de religion (vers 1525 – vers 1610)*. 2 vols. Paris: Champion, 1990.
- Daniélou, Jean. *From Shadows to Reality. Studies in the Biblical Typology of the Fathers*. Translated by Wulstan Hibberd. London: Burns & Oates, 1960.
- Demiéville, Paul. "Le bouddhisme et la guerre: Post-Scriptum à l'*Histoire des moines guerriers du Japon* de G[aston] Renoudeau." *Mélanges publiés par l'Institut des Hautes Études Chinoises* 1 (1957): 347–385.
- Demiéville, Paul. *Choix d'études bouddhiques (1229–1270)*. Leiden: Brill, 1973.
- Demiéville, Paul. "Buddhism and War." In *Buddhist Warfare*, edited by Michael Jerryson and Mark Juergensmeyer, 17–52. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Derry, Ken. "Review of *Apocalypse in Islam*, by Jean-Pierre Filiu." *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 81, no. 2 (2013): 539–542.
- Donner, Fred M. "From Believers to Muslims: Confessional Identity in the Early Islamic Community." *Al-Abhath* 51–52 (2002–2003): 9–53.

- Fierro, Maribel. "Conversion, Ancestry and Universal Religion: The Case of the Almohads in the Islamic West (Six/Twelfth – Seventh/Thirteenth Centuries)." *Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies* 2, no. 2 (2010): 155–173.
- Fierro, Maribel. "A Muslim Land without Jews or Christians." In *Christlicher Norden – Muslimischer Süden. Ansprüche und Wirklichkeiten von Christen, Juden und Muslimen auf der Iberischen Halbinsel im Hoch- und Spätmittelalter*, edited by Matthias Tischler and Alexander Fidora, 231–247. Vol. 7, *Erudiri Sapientia*. Münster: Aschendorff, 2011.
- Filiu, Jean-Pierre. *Apocalypse in Islam*. Translated by M.B. DeBevoise. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012.
- Firestone, Reuven. *Jihad. The Origin of Holy War in Islam*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Flori, Jean. *La guerre sainte. La formation de l'idée de croisade dans l'Occident chrétien*. Paris: Aubier, 2001.
- Flori, Jean. *Chroniqueurs et propagandistes. Introduction critique aux sources de la première croisade*. Vol. 98, *Hautes études médiévales et modernes*. Geneva: Droz, 2010.
- Gaposchkin, Cecilia M. *Invisible Weapons: Liturgy and the Making of Crusade Ideology*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2017.
- García-Arenal, Mercedes. ed. *Mahdisme et millénarisme en Islam*. Aix-en-Provence: Édisud, 2000.
- García-Arenal, Mercedes. *Messianism and Puritanical Reform: Mahdīs of the Muslim West*. Vol. 29, *The Medieval and Early Modern Iberian World*. Leiden: Brill, 2006.
- Grodzins, Morton. "Metropolitan Segregation." *Scientific American* 197, no. 4 (1957): 33–41.
- Housley, Norman. *Religious Warfare in Europe 1400–1536*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Huber, Lukas. "The Eternal Crusader. The Crusader Enemy and his Allies in the Words of Jihadi Online Propaganda." PhD diss., University of Vienna, forthcoming.
- Lagardère, Vincent. "Le gīhād almohade: théorie et pratique." In *Los Almohades: Problemas y Perspectivas*, edited by Patrick Cressier, Maribel Fierro and Luis Molina, 2:617–631. *Estudios árabes e islámicos*. Vol. 11, *Monografías*. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 2005.
- Landes, Richard. "Millenarismus Absconditus: L'historiographie Augustinienne et l'An Mil." *Le Moyen Age* 98 (1993): 355–377.
- Landes, Richard. *Heaven on Earth. The Varieties of the Millennial Experience*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Lapina, Elizabeth. *Warfare and the Miraculous in the Chronicles of the First Crusade*. University Park: Pennsylvania University Press, 2015.
- Lincoln, Bruce. *Holy Terrors. Thinking about Religion after September 11*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003.
- Lobrichon, Guy. *1099. Jérusalem conquise*. Paris: Seuil, 1998.
- Lubac, Henri de. *Medieval Exegesis*. Vol. 1, *The Four Senses of Scripture*. Translated by Mark Sebanc. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1998.
- Marra, Michele. "The Development of Mappō Thought in Japan." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 15, no. 1 (1988): 25–54, and no. 4 (1988): 289–305.
- McCants, William. *The ISIS Apocalypse: The History, Strategy, and Doomsday Vision of the Islamic State*. New York: MacMillan, 2015.
- Potestà, Gian Luca, and Marco Rizzi. *L'anticristo*. 3 vols. Milano: Il Mulino, 2005–2017.
- Quinet, Edgar. *Le christianisme et la révolution française*. Paris: Imprimeurs-Unis, 1845.
- Rubenstein, Jay. "Godfrey of Bouillon versus Raymond of Saint-Gilles: How Carolingian Kingship Trumped Millenarianism at the End of the First Crusade." In *The Legend of Charlemagne in the Middle Ages: Power, Faith and Crusade*, edited by Matthew Gabriele, 59–75. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2008.

- Rubenstein, Jay. *Armies of Heaven: The First Crusade and the Quest for Apocalypse*. New York: Basic Books, 2011.
- Rubenstein, Jay. "Crusade and Apocalypse: History and the Last Days." *Questiones Medii Aevi Novae* 21 (2016): 159–188.
- Rubenstein, Jay. *Nebuchadnezzar's Dream: Prophecy, History, and the First Crusade*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2019.
- Sahlins, Marshall. *Islands of History*. Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1985.
- Sahlins, Marshall. *How "Natives" Think. About Captain Cook, for Example*. Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1995.
- Shoemaker, Stephen J. *Death of a Prophet: The End of Muhammad's Life and the Beginnings of Islam*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012.
- Shoemaker, Stephen J. "'The Reign of God Has Come': Eschatology and Empire in Late Antiquity and Early Islam." *Arabica* 61, no. 5 (2014): 514–558.
- Stone, Jacqueline. *Original Enlightenment and the Transformation of Medieval Japanese Buddhism*. Vol. 12, Studies in East Asian Buddhism. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999.
- Stone, Jacqueline. "Rebuking the Enemies of the Lotus. Nichirenist Exclusivism in Historical Perspective." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 21, no. 2–3 (1994): 231–259.
- Terrier, Mathieu. "Le combat sacré des vaincus de l'Histoire: Expérience et représentation du *Jihād* dans le Shi'isme imamite ancien." *Journal Asiatique* 305, no. 1 (2017): 23–31.