Iveta Kestere & Baiba Kalke

Chapter 2

“Solemn as the Kremlin”? Emotions of Teachers in Soviet Classroom Photos

Introduction

Teaching and learning are emotional processes.¹ Therefore understanding, disciplining or normalizing, suppressing, and displaying emotions present a field of research for educational psychologists, philosophers, sociologists, and anthropologists – a field in which extensive research experience has already been invested.² Since the end of the twentieth century, emotions have also become a thriving and dynamic (sub)field of historical studies,³ joining many “turns”⁴ in the history of education, too. Whereas in psychology, emotions are viewed as “located in the individual,”⁵ historians are among those who take emotion research outside of the human psyche. They reveal emotions as social constructs, that is, as generated by standards, values, and beliefs rooted in an individual’s experience and developed in certain historical, sociocultural, political, and institutional contexts.⁶ Thorough examination of these contexts lets historian’s questions in emotion research be answered. In turn, studying

1 Leanne Fried, Caroline Mansfield, and Eva Dobozy, “Teacher Emotion Research: Introducing a Conceptual Model to Guide Future Research,” *Issues in Educational Research* 25, no. 4 (2015): 417; Paul A. Schutz, “Inquiry on Teachers’ Emotion,” *Educational Psychologist* 49, no. 1 (2014): 1.

2 Fried, Mansfield, and Dobozy compiled 151 papers on emotions in education, including 82 articles on teachers’ emotions published in English language journals between 2003 and 2013, and found in major databases (e.g., ERIC, PsychArticles, SAGE, etc.). This number of articles testifies to the popularity of emotion related phenomena in modern educational research. See Fried, Mansfield, and Dobozy, “Teacher Emotion Research,” 418.

3 Piroska Nagy, “History of Emotions,” in *Debating New Approaches to History*, ed. Marek Tamm and Peter Burke (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2019), 189.

4 E.g., the affective turn, the visual turn, the linguistic turn, the transnational turn and others, called by Osterhammel “carefully orchestrated ‘turns’ in global history.” See Jürgen Osterhammel “Global History,” in *Debating New Approaches to History*, ed. Marek Tamm and Peter Burke (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2019), 22.

5 Michalinos Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity: A Poststructural Perspective,” *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice* 9, no. 3 (August 2003): 216.

6 Schutz, “Inquiry on Teachers’ Emotion,” 3; Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 213, 216; Megan Boler, *Feeling Power. Emotions and Education* (New York, London: Routledge, 1999), 19; Lúgina Mortari, “Emotions and Education: Reflecting on the Emotional Experience,” *European Journal of Educational Research* 4, no. 4 (October 2015): 159; Fried, Mansfield, and Dobozy, “Teacher Emotion Research,” 421, 223; Joakim Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling,” *Paedagogica Historica* 51, no. 1–2 (February–April 2015): 115.

emotions from a historical perspective gives insight into the society which ordered, produced, and/or used particular emotions.⁷

The connection of emotions to a certain historical context determined the focus of this study. Our goal is to reveal the representation of teachers' emotions in the context of the Soviet authoritarian rule. Contributing to emotion research in the history of education, the present study is a continuation of our previous projects devoted to teacher image.⁸

The study of emotions from a historical perspective is challenging. It is virtually impossible to adequately reconstruct true emotions of the individual at a particular moment with the traditional tools of the historian. However, Schutz's study of emotional episodes, in which emotions manifest themselves as an appraisal of the event at a certain moment of communication, is methodologically helpful here.⁹ It is also in line with Nagy's claim that emotions can be investigated as an event from a historical perspective.¹⁰ Photography is a useful source here: in the ever-changing dynamic flow of emotions, the photographer can "stop" or "freeze" an episode, providing material for emotion analysis. Since any shot is created in a certain time and space, photography is also very telling in the context of emotion formation.¹¹ Documentary photography provides information, revealing what may remain hidden in written or oral sources,¹² and especially in documents, press, and literature heavily censored by the Soviet authorities.¹³

7 Nagy, "History of Emotions," 199, 201.

8 Iveta Kestere and Baiba Kalke, "Controlling the Image of the Teacher's Body Under Authoritarianism: The Case of Soviet Latvia (1953–1984)," *Paedagogica Historica* 54, no. 1–2 (2018): 184–203; Iveta Kestere, and Baiba Kalke, "The Visual Image of the Teachers: A Ten-Country Perspective," *Revista Colombiana de Educación* 68 (2015): 19–40; Iveta Kestere, Charl Wolhuter, and Ricardo Lozano, eds., *The Visual Image of the Teacher: International Comparative Perspectives* (Riga: RaKa, 2012).

9 Schutz, "Inquiry on Teachers' Emotion," 3.

10 Nagy, "History of Emotions," 200–201.

11 Joan M. Schwartz, "Negotiating the Visual Turn: New Perspectives on Images and Archives," *American Archivist* 47, no. 1 (2004): 107–122; see also Peter Burke, *Eyewitnessing. The Use of Images as Historical Evidence* (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 2001), 178.

12 Susan Sontag, *On Photography* (New York: RosettaBooks LLC, 1973/2005), 16; Sjaak Braster, "Educational Change and Dutch Classroom Photographs. A Qualitative and Quantitative Analysis," in *The Black Box of Schooling. A Cultural History of the Classroom*, ed. Sjaak Braster, Ian Grosvenor, and María del Mar Del Pozo (Bruxelles et al.: Peter Lang, 2011), 36; Catharina Hultkrantz, "Beneath the Great Dome: Photographs as Means in the Study of the Senses and Emotions of Day-to-Day School Life," in *Engaging with Educational Space. Visualizing Spaces of Teaching and Learning*, ed. Catherine Burke, Ian Grosvenor, and Björn Norlin (Umeå: Department of Historical, Philosophical and Religious Studies, 2014), 102; Ian Grosvenor, "On Visualising Past Classrooms," in *Silences and Images: The Social History of the Classroom*, ed. Ian Grosvenor, Martin Lawn, and Kate Rousmaniere (New York: Peter Lang, 1999).

13 Henrihs Strods, *PSRS politiskā cenzūra Latvijā 1940–1990* [USSR political censorship in Latvia, 1940–1990] (Riga: Jumava, 2010).

In analyzing 205 class photos taken between 1945 and 1985, our study asked the following questions: What emotions did teachers find important to demonstrate officially, namely, in specially organized classroom photos? How do expressed emotions reveal the identity of the Soviet teacher? How do we understand and explain emotions of teachers depicted in the photos?

In order to analyze the representation of teacher's emotions, we will present the historical context in which, along with the identity of the Soviet teacher, their emotional experience developed.

Soviet Teacher Identity

Teacher identity is “historically situated” and constructed and reconstructed through social interactions in which emotions are generated and expressed. Emotions are both an identity resource and, as identity is expressed through emotions, a form of identity representation.¹⁴ Emotions are less of a teacher's personal choice and more the “emotional regime” associated with a political power that creates norms concerning emotional behavior.¹⁵ The Soviet Union was no exception in setting certain requirements to what, in Foucauldian terms, could be called the “normalization” of teachers' emotions.¹⁶

Latvia provides a unique context in which to analyze such emotional regimes and identity representation. The country was occupied and incorporated into the Soviet Union in 1940, but the purposeful formation of the Soviet teacher began after the Second World War. As Sergei Prozorov and Mara Irene Lazda have detailed, the cornerstone of Soviet pedagogy was the “biopolitical project” of shaping the New Soviet Man¹⁷ modelled on a generalized copy of the Leader, that is, a soldier of the Red (Soviet) Army.¹⁸ This soldier was an embodiment of all moral qualities highly valued in communist ideology – a strictly disciplined person who, by denying his individuality and personal interests, makes every effort to achieve the common

¹⁴ Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 213–218; Fried, Mansfield, and Dobozy, “Teacher Emotion Research,” 425.

¹⁵ Nagy, “History of Emotions,” 200.

¹⁶ See Martin Hewitt, “Bio-Politics and Social Policy: Foucault's Account of Welfare,” in *The Body. Social Process and Cultural Theory*, ed. Mike Featherstone, Mike Helpworth, and Bryan S. Turner, 2nd. ed. (London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: Sage Publications, 2001), 229.

¹⁷ Sergei Prozorov, “The Biopolitics of Stalinism: Ideas and Bodies in Soviet Governmentality,” *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political* 38, no. 3 (August 2013): 208–227.

¹⁸ Mara Irene Lazda, “Gender and Totalitarianism: Soviet and Nazi Occupations of Latvia (1940–1945)” (PhD diss., Indiana University, 2005), 105, 107.

goals of society, a hero, a “real man” even in a female body.¹⁹ Such an abstraction was easy to understand: it set clear guidelines for the collective identity and served perfectly well for all kinds of propaganda.²⁰ An important role in the Soviets’ project was allocated to the teacher, who had to be a model of the New Soviet Man for children, their parents, and society in general.

To uncover what emotional qualities were expected of the teacher as a “New-Soviet-Man”, we studied 13 teacher manuals published between 1946 and 1983 and which were used by teacher training institutions throughout the Soviet Union.²¹ Teacher emotions are discussed in 23 excerpts and, given the ideologized pedagogical context, the content did not surprise us: the main expectation of a Soviet teacher was emotional control. In several manuals, this requirement was supported by quotations from the classic Soviet pedagogue Anton Makarenko (1888–1939). For example, “if you feel unhappy, your first moral duty is that no one should know about it.”²² The teacher must be “self-contained,”²³ “calm,”²⁴ with “a great control of the facial muscles.”²⁵ He should not be easily irritated or nervous.²⁶ The teacher must neither react to students’ indiscipline with anger (pounding on the table, shouting²⁷), nor is a “long face” allowed.²⁸ The only approved emotional expression is a smile, since the teacher must be “kind and benevolent,”²⁹ but avoid familiarity.³⁰ In the words of

¹⁹ See Yulia Gradskaia, *Soviet People with Female Bodies: Performing Beauty and Maternity in Soviet Russia in the Mid 1930–1960s* (Stockholm: Stockholm University, 2007).

²⁰ Gloria Calhoun, “Saints into Soviets: Russian Orthodox Symbolism and Soviet Political Posters” (MA diss., Georgia State University, 2014), 34. https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1089&context=history_theses (accessed February 1, 2020).

²¹ The number of teacher manuals published in the Soviet Union is not large, as each book was severely censored going through various stages of testing. However, the books had a large circulation and were used in teacher training throughout the Soviet Union.

²² SP Baranov, et al. *Pedagogika* [Pedagogy] (Moscow: Prosvesceniye, 1981), 327; Tatjana Ilyina, *Pedagogika. Uchebnoye posobie dlja studentov pedagogiceskih institutov* [Pedagogy. Teacher manual for students of pedagogical institutes] (Moscow: Prosvesceniye, 1969), 232.

²³ BP Jesipovs, et al. *Pedagoģija* [Pedagogy] (Riga: Latvijas Valsts izdevnieciba, 1948), 127.

²⁴ Baranov, et al. *Pedagogika* [Pedagogy], 10.

²⁵ Ilyina, *Pedagogika. Uchebnoye posobie dlja studentov pedagogiceskih institutov* [Pedagogy. Teacher manual for students of pedagogical institutes], 232.

²⁶ JN Medinskij, *Prosvesceniye v SSSR* [Education in USSR] (Moscow: Gos.ucebno-pedagogickoje izdatelstvo, 1955); NJ Koval'ov, et al., *Vvedeniye v pedagogiku* [Introduction in pedagogy] (Moscow: Prosvesceniye, 1975).

²⁷ JK Babansky (ed.) *Pedagogika* [Pedagogy] (Moscow: Prosvesceniye, 1983), 302.

²⁸ Ilyina, *Pedagogika. Uchebnoye posobie dlja studentov pedagogiceskih institutov* [Pedagogy. Teacher manual for students of pedagogical institutes], 232.

²⁹ Ilyina, *Pedagogika. Uchebnoye posobie dlja studentov pedagogiceskih institutov* [Pedagogy. Teacher manual for students of pedagogical institutes], 232; Babansky (ed.) *Pedagogika* [Pedagogy], 200.

³⁰ BP Jesupov, NK Goncarov, *Pedagogika* [Pedagogy] (Moscow: Ucpedizdat, 1950), 385.

Hagedorn, Vails, and Geniss, the teacher’s body turned into an organized space,³¹ becoming as solemn as the Kremlin.³² As non-compliance with the rules set by authorities was dangerous in the Soviet Union, threatened with at least public humiliation,³³ we expected to see a soldier-like self-image in the photographs.

Teacher’s Emotions in Photographs: Research Methodology

School photographs offer an inexhaustible range of emotional episodes captured in a variety of situations, such as lessons and breaks, trips and holidays, exams and graduation ceremonies, and many others. As Zembylas has noted, the human body in a photo is a “very revealing practical surface”³⁴ through which emotions manifest and become performative, disclosing how people communicate emotions through body posture, gestures, facial expressions, and eye movements.³⁵

In order to make teachers’ emotions comparable, we chose emotional episodes recorded in a certain space, namely, the classroom. Here, the classroom is also important as a daily environment where the teacher is the “boss” and therefore safe, thus increasing our confidence that even in front of the camera lens, teachers’ emotions approximate the everyday style of emotional communication.

The second criterion for selecting the photos was the staging, i.e., we chose only those photos in which the camera and, thus, the photographer’s eye, were seen or felt by their subjects – the teachers were ready to be photographed and had chosen how to represent themselves in the photo. As Zembylas notes, teacher identity is “articulated through talk, social interaction, and self-presentation.”³⁶ Thus, a self-representing image, including expressed emotions, reveals and helps to understand teacher identity.

31 Jörg Hagedorn, “Körper und Raum. Raumerschliessungs- und Raumeneignungsprozesse Jugendlicher in narrativen Selbstpraxen” in *Räume bilden – pädagogische Perspektiven auf den Raum*, ed. Constanze Berndt, Klaudia Kalish, und Anja Krüger (Bad Heilbrunn: Verlag Julius Klinkhardt, 2016), 155.

32 Pjotr Vails and Aleksandrs Geniss, *60.gadi. Padomju cilvēka pasaule* [The 60s. The World of Soviet People] (Riga: Jumava, 2006), 60.

33 Kestere, and Kalke, “Controlling the Image of the Teacher’s Body under Authoritarianism,” 202.

34 Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 229.

35 Paul A. Schutz and Reinhard Pekrun, eds., *Emotion in Education* (Amsterdam: Academic Press, 2007); Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 227; Nagy, “History of Emotions,” 194; Margaux Lhommet and Stacy C. Marsella, “Expressing Emotion Through Posture and Gesture,” in *The Oxford Handbook of Affective Computing*, ed. Rafael Calvo, Sidney D’Mello, Jonathan Gratch, and Arvid Kappas (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), DOI: 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199942237.013.039.

36 Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 215.

The third and most important criterion was the presence of students in the photographs, because teachers' emotions cannot be viewed separately from their students' emotions or those of other staff members:³⁷ "Emotions and their communication through expressions are born in a dialogue as a living rejoinder of our experiences, and they are shaped in dialogical interaction with other emotions that are constantly becoming."³⁸ The emotions of a person acting as a teacher are channeled through communication with others, and it is only through relationships that these emotions may be understood.

Of our collection of approximately 400 unpublished school photos, 205 images corresponded to the selected criteria. The photographs were found in the Latvian State Archive of Audiovisual Documents, the National History Museum of Latvia, the Museum of Riga Schools, the Pedagogical Museum of the University of Latvia, several town museums (in Valmiera, Liepāja, Daugavpils, and Dobele), the Kubalu School Museum, Ikšķile Secondary School Museum, private collections, at collectors' markets, and on the Internet site *Lost Latvia*.³⁹ The photographs cover the period from 1945 to 1985, until Gorbachev's *perestroika* softened the harsh political climate in the Soviet Union. The photographs depict 212 teachers from urban and rural schools in Latvia, of whom 80.1% were women and 19.9% men; the ratio matched the overall gender ratio in the education system of Soviet Latvia.⁴⁰

The photographs were statistically processed according to several indicators (gender, body posture, facial expressions). In turn, our qualitative analysis of emotional episodes used hermeneutics, revealing the meaning of photographs in their mutual dialogue and dialogue with researchers, supplementing this communication with research in psychology and history. We were guided by Davey's interpretation of Hans-Georg Gadamer's reflection that "(. . .) understanding is always established in practice. And it comes into existence as 'meaning' only through a dialectical and dialogical encounter with others. (. . .) understanding is the always incomplete result of critical appropriation."⁴¹ A photograph is one person's view

37 Fried, Mansfield and Dobozy, "Teacher Emotion Research," 427.

38 Zembylas, "Emotions and Teacher Identity," 223.

39 "Latvijas Nacionālā bibliotēka. Zudusi Latvija senos zīmējumos, atklātnēs un fotogrāfijās no 19. gs. beigām līdz mūsdienām" [National Library of Latvia. Lost Latvia in ancient drawings, postcards, and photographs from the end of the nineteenth century to the present day], <http://www.zudusilatvija.lv/> (accessed March 9, 2020).

40 In 1959 in the Latvian SSR, 74.9% of workers in education, science and the arts were women and only 25.1% were men. *Itogi vsesojuznoi perepisi naselenija 1959 goda. Latvijskaja SSR* [Soviet Union 1959 census results. Latvian SSR] (Moscow: Gosstatizdat CSU SSSR, 1963), 37.

41 Gerald J. Davey, "Understanding Photographic Representation: Method and Meaning in the Interpretation of Photographs" (PhD diss., University of Iowa), 1992, 119.

of another, while the researcher interprets the information from her own position; so, when trying to understand other people's emotions, one must also keep the presence of one's own emotions in mind.⁴² Grosvenor warns that we read school photos through our own memories of schooling.⁴³ It should be acknowledged that the interpretation of the photographs in this study was inevitably affected by our personal experience of studying and working in Soviet schools from the late 1960s to the mid-1980s. However, this experience was also an asset as it helped to better understand the historical context and reveal it “from within.” In any event, understanding and explaining teachers' emotions is possible from different perspectives, and no one has the final say in it.

In the episodes captured in classroom photographs, teachers present themselves in emotional communication in two simultaneous directions – with the photographer, through the camera eye, and the student audience. The emotions revealed in these communications will be analyzed below.

Teacher's Emotional Communication with the Camera/Photographer

Teachers have a certain idea of how they want to see their students, and whether they achieve a “perfect” class is closely linked to their self-assessment, i.e., how successful teachers see themselves.⁴⁴ As Zembylas notes, “Their classroom become[s] a main source of their self-esteem and fulfilment as well as their vulnerability.”⁴⁵ Thus, teachers identify with their students, and the image of the class becomes an indicator of the teacher's personal success and so produces their emotions. If teachers are able to deal successfully with a particular event by providing an orderly classroom, they have reached their goal, and this evokes positive emotions,⁴⁶ or at least reassuring ones. In turn, the inability to control the situation in the classroom leads to a feeling of helplessness, self-blame, and shame, which could result “in anger at the system,”⁴⁷ and in our case, the camera is the guilty party. This theoretical insight into teachers' feelings is illustrated by the emotional episodes captured in the classroom photographs.

⁴² Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 230.

⁴³ Ian Grosvenor, ““To Act on the Minds of the Children” Paintings into Schools and English Education,” in *The Black Box of Schooling. A Cultural History of the Classroom*, ed. Sjaak Braster, Ian Grosvenor, and María del Mar Del Pozo (Bruxelles: Peter Lang, 2011), 55.

⁴⁴ Schutz, “Inquiry on Teachers' Emotion,” 3.

⁴⁵ Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 216.

⁴⁶ Reinhard Weiner, “Examining Emotional Diversity in the Classroom: An Attribution Theorist Considers the Moral Emotions,” in *Emotion in Education*, ed. Paul. A. Schutz and Reinhard Pekrun (Amsterdam: Academic Press, 2007), 78.

⁴⁷ Schutz, “Inquiry on Teachers' Emotion,” 3; Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 228.

A photographer who comes to the class is most often a stranger, an “outsider.” The traditional, ritualized order of the learning process is interrupted, and the teacher has to present the class in front of the camera. The moment captured in the photograph will be immortalized, distributed outside the classroom walls, and an unpredictable number of people will view, i.e., evaluate, the photograph from then on. If teachers are aware of it, then shooting becomes an important event for them, evoking emotions: “The beliefs about things we conceive of as important with regard to one’s well-being produce evaluative thoughts, and these appraisals generate emotions.”⁴⁸ For conscientious teachers, a photo session turns into an openly dramatic test, as their professional pride is challenged, and it forces them to present their class, and therefore themselves, in the most perfect manner.

A planned photo shoot begins with the teacher and the photographer agreeing on the staging. From the photographer’s point of view, classroom photography had two aims. The first was to photograph as many students as possible, not only to capture a particular moment in time, but also for profit. Photographs could be sold for a few kopeks, and the proceeds from group photos were higher than from individual portraits.⁴⁹ The second aim could be publicity photos for press, an exhibition, a school history album, or some other public exposition. As Sontag quips, every photograph is “commerce between art and truth.”⁵⁰ So no matter how commercial their goal might be, photographers are also driven by artistic ambitions, and consequently their creative vision is invested in the photo image of the teacher too.

When looking at old photographs, it is not easy to determine who was “in charge” at the time of photography – the teacher or the photographer. In any case, teachers chose how to present themselves in the limited drama of classroom photography.

In most photographs (56.6%), teachers are standing at the wall in the back or the middle of the classroom, thus reviewing the whole “playing field” and controlling the situation (Figs. 2.1 and 2.2); 18.1% of teachers are standing or sitting among a group of students (Fig. 2.3).

17.9% are “teaching,” that is, teachers are standing in front of the class and speaking, eliciting students’ answers, demonstrating teaching aids, observing the work of a student or students, or “helping” an individual student (Fig. 2.4).

Only 7.4% of teachers take the same position as students, sitting alongside their pupils at school desks (Fig. 2.5).

It is not difficult to conclude from the statistics above that most teachers chose, or were placed in, a position of power, leading or controlling the situation in the

⁴⁸ Mortari, “Emotions and Education,” 159.

⁴⁹ Peteris Korsaks (a professional photographer), in discussion with the author Iveta Kestere, September 2015.

⁵⁰ Sontag, *On Photography*, 4.

Fig. 2.1: Dundaga parish, 1954. Kubalu School Museum Collection (KSM1689F).

Fig. 2.2: Riga, 1950s. Museum of Riga Schools Collection.

Fig. 2.3: Riga, around 1957. Museum of Riga Schools Collection.

Fig. 2.4: Riga, around 1947–50. Latvian State Archive of Audiovisual Documents Collection (LNA LVKFFDA 1.f., 6542N. I.) Photographer: Belovs.

Fig. 2.5: Riga, 1980. Private collection.

classroom. Their stature is tight (“A straight posture is judged more positively”)⁵¹ and the comparison with the Kremlin and a soldier stays valid at all times. There is only one photograph where a female teacher is leaning relaxedly against the wall, having apparently transferred some “power” to the photographer.

Teachers, it seems, do not like being photographed, especially males.⁵² Photography pulls teachers out of their comfort zone, they lack experience in organizing a photograph, and the delegation of power to the photographer makes them doubt their status as “owner” of the class. The lack of action and static posture in a normally dynamic classroom make teachers feel awkward, and perhaps that is why in photographs they often chose to imitate action, that is, to teach. Another option for “escaping” the photographer’s eye is looking in a book (10%); a task which also keeps hands occupied, saving the teacher the awkward choice between holding their hand

⁵¹ Lhommel and Marsella, “Expressing Emotion Through Posture and Gesture,” in *Oxford Library of Psychology: The Oxford Handbook of Affective Computing*, ed. Rafael Calvo, Sidney K. D’Mello, Jonathan Gratch, and Arvid Kappas (Oxford University Press, 2014): 273–285.

⁵² The restrained attitude of male teachers towards photography is revealed in a small empirical study by Deldén, where a female teacher looking at photographs “often referred to her feelings,” but a male teacher “had a more rational approach toward the photographs.” See Maria Deldén, “The Teacher and Educational Spaces: The Photograph as a Tool for Teacher Reflection,” in *Engaging with Educational Space: Visualizing Spaces of Teaching and Learning*, ed. Catherine Burke, Ian Grosvenor, and Björn Norlin (Umeå: Department of Historical, Philosophical and Religious Studies, 2014), 58.

crossed behind, clenched in fists, or pressed firmly to the sides, among other options. However, even if the teacher is put in an inevitable confrontation with the photographer, for example, in a group photograph, she is capable of avoiding the lens: the eyes are lowered, inward-looking or look into the distance (Fig. 2.3). Obligated to appear in pictures, teachers look as if they are making a sacrifice.

Smiles and laughter are easy-to-read positive emotions, communicating joy and well-being.⁵³ A smile is one of the “permitted” emotions for Soviet teachers, so photographers traditionally encouraged their audience to smile. However, smiling teachers are not common, and the difficulty to keep a smiling facial expression while waiting for a photo to be taken can be a poor excuse here. In photos, a serious teacher is often surrounded by smiling students (Fig. 2.3).

The photographs of smiling teachers reveal a significant gender difference, with 28.8% of female teachers and only 9.5% of male teachers smiling. Thus, seriousness is “masculine,” and that is how most female teachers choose to present themselves too. The word “masculinity” had a particularly positive meaning in Soviet vocabulary – it was associated with both soldiers’ heroism in war and overcoming difficulties in peaceful times.⁵⁴ Even if a photo was shot on a holiday, as evidenced by flowers and festive costumes, the teacher’s face remains serious (Fig. 2.3). Braster writes that sadness in school pictures does not always reflect daily school life.⁵⁵ However, the teacher’s choice is what is important in our study, and they convincingly present themselves as serious individuals. Moreover, with teachers’ eyes looking directly at the camera, their self-image is often emotionally silent, that is, their emotions are illegible.

Teacher’s Emotional Communication with Students

When teachers and students have their photo taken together, the emotions conveyed can be read not just from the teacher but also from the students and even the activity portrayed. Emotions become an act of communication in which all share. It is in this context that their mutual emotions are formed and expressed.

When teachers are “teaching” in photographs, their postures, gestures, and facial expressions indicate at times exaggerated and theatrical interest, concern, question, and criticism, instructing the viewer how to “read” the emotions and thus showing

⁵³ Disa A. Sauter, Nicole M. McDonald, Devon N. Gangi, and Daniel S. Messinger, “Nonverbal Expressions of Positive Emotions,” in *Handbook of Positive Emotions*, ed. Michele M. Tugade, Michelle N. Shiota, and Leslie D. Kirby (Guilford Press, 2014), 185, 188–189.

⁵⁴ During the 1970s and 1980s, the Soviet school curriculum was supplemented by ‘Lesson in Manhood,’ during which students met people (often military personnel) who told them about their service or heroic deeds.

⁵⁵ Braster, “Educational Change and Dutch Classroom Photographs,” 28.

what “real” teaching looks like (Fig. 2.4). The common viewpoint is obvious – a smile is not a teaching companion. Gestures are directed at teaching aids alone: the teacher shows a book, points at a map, demonstrates laboratory equipment, writes on the board, etc. The exception is two teachers who lean towards their students, carrying a positive message through their posture and touch. The latter facilitates social bonding and promotes cooperation: “From early infancy, touch may be an important modality for communicating positive emotion that facilitates the development of secure attachment.”⁵⁶

However, discipline is the main concern for teachers in photographs. Teachers who take a strategic position as a guardian of order at the side wall of the classroom seem particularly anxious. From that vantage point, not only can the teacher see the audience of seated students, but also the students can see their teacher in turn, being constantly reminded that they are under supervision (Fig. 2.2). Even if the “power” is given to the camera situated in the center of the event, the teacher does not cease to be a guardian. Schutz writes that the teacher has two roles in the classroom: “A caring teacher” and “a disciplinarian,”⁵⁷ but in trying to combine the two, the teacher turns into the “caring police.”⁵⁸

The discipline a teacher expects from students is control over emotions, which most often means emotional suppression.⁵⁹ When students’ emotions are disciplined, the teacher feels comfortable, for she has proven her authority by “handling the class.”⁶⁰ As a result, in a photo, a serious teacher and neat students belong to the same emotional community with synchronized emotions (Fig. 2.1).⁶¹ Everyone is frozen and emotionally quiet, as that is the surest way to present a “proper” class. Only one photo in our collection is different (Fig. 2.5). It shows a teacher sitting among students, allowing herself to turn her back on the “suspicious” boys in the last row. Although everyone is apparently sharing positive emotions, and the photo shoot is a shared experience and not a dramatic duty, discipline is not forgotten, and the students’ arms are neatly crossed on their desks.

Like any power, a teacher’s power over students’ emotions – the power to define, control, contain, and evaluate them – leads to resistance.⁶² The teacher is constantly surrounded by an audience that is quite critical of discipline⁶³ and tends to use released

56 Sauter, McDonald, Gangi, and Messinger, “Nonverbal Expressions of Positive Emotions,” 183.

57 Schutz, “Inquiry on Teachers’ Emotion,” 5.

58 Boler, *Feeling Power*, 42.

59 Nagy, “History of Emotions,” 192; Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 216.

60 Fried, Mansfield, and Dobozy, “Teacher Emotion Research,” 426.

61 See Landahl about emotional communities (Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling,” 106).

62 Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling,” 109; James C. Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1990), 18.

63 Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling,” 113.

emotions as a “mode of resistance.”⁶⁴ Students can avoid emotionally “organized” communities that teachers take great pains to create, forming “communities of resistance,”⁶⁵ and teachers are left alone with their own emotions. Indiscipline in the class entraps teachers’ emotions. On the one hand, authority must be saved and the disobedient must be controlled; on the other hand, care must be taken with how viewers of the photograph will “decode”⁶⁶ teachers’ emotions. For the teacher, showing emotions is associated with a “considerable risk of vulnerability.”⁶⁷

Emotion researchers emphasize that teachers are expected to leave their emotions “outside” the classroom. If they want to be objective and professional at work, teachers’ emotions have to be “managed” and more salient than students’ emotions.⁶⁸ The teacher should first “self-police”⁶⁹ to control how students subsequently follow the declared “emotional rules.”⁷⁰ Thus, one of the indications of a teacher’s professionalism is to be an example of self-control and restrained emotions, even when faced with challenges. Teachers are expected to express pleasant emotions (but not too pleasant) and repress unpleasant ones. Nonetheless, a display of frustration is more socially accepted than one of anger.⁷¹ Indeed, in the photographs, teachers’ responses to violations of discipline show more emotional silence or anxiety than anger.

To discipline the classroom, in addition to themselves being a “warning” (a visible or perceptible presence), teachers use gaze as a disciplining tool. In 28.3% of photographs, teacher attention is focused not on the camera, but on students, and especially on the boys in the back of the classroom (Fig. 2.2). This is revealed by the teacher’s gaze, which is trained to see all students at the same time, “reading the room.”⁷² The teacher’s gaze “was not only something the teacher used in order to see, it was also something that communicated an emotional message that could be read by the pupils.”⁷³ In the photographs, the teacher gaze pierces the disobedient; it asks, warns and rebukes, but balances on the verge of anger. Teachers who chose to present themselves as policemen, reveal that their priority is a “proper” class and

⁶⁴ Boler, *Feeling Power. Emotions and Education*, xviii.

⁶⁵ Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling,” 112, 114.

⁶⁶ See Lhommet and Marsella, “Expressing Emotion Through Posture and Gesture,” DOI: 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199942237.013.039.

⁶⁷ Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 232.

⁶⁸ Schutz, “Inquiry on Teachers’ Emotion,” 7; Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 226; Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling,” 109.

⁶⁹ Boler, *Feeling Power*, 31.

⁷⁰ Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity,” 226.

⁷¹ Schutz, “Inquiry on Teachers’ Emotion,” 5–6.

⁷² Schutz, “Inquiry on Teachers’ Emotion,” 7; Joakim Landahl, “Learning to Listen and Look: The Shift from the Monitorial System of Education to Teacher-led Lessons,” *The Senses and Society* 14, no. 2 (2019): 200.

⁷³ Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling,” 202.

that their self-image enables them to express tension, anxiety, restlessness, alarm, and agitation, albeit justified in the name of professionalism to ensure order.

Episodes in which the teacher is in an emotional dialogue with students are particularly significant to teacher identity research. They reflect previous experiences of teacher-student relationships, the type of relationship teachers prefer, and teachers' general beliefs about teaching and learning.

Conclusion

The research methodology of this study into teachers' emotions from a historical perspective came from a number of hypothetical considerations, namely:

- 1) School photography is one of the visual media that publicizes teachers' professional identity in general, and the visual image in the public space in particular. Therefore, formal classroom photographs (as opposed to snapshots) reveal the image that the teacher wishes to convey to others.
- 2) The visual image in a photograph reveals a person's current emotional state. The photograph “stops” or “freezes” the ever-changing dynamic flow of emotions. In line with Schutz and Nagy's research,⁷⁴ we viewed the teachers' emotions as an episode or event in response to a specific situation in the classroom, an occurrence produced by the interaction between teacher, pupil and photographer. Given that people communicate emotions through body postures, gestures, facial expressions, and eye movements, we analyzed 205 class photos based on these criteria.
- 3) We were guided by the belief that in historical studies, emotions are understood as social constructs, that is, as generated by standards, values, and beliefs developed in certain historical, sociocultural, political, and institutional contexts. We looked at teachers' emotions and analyzed their specifics in a certain historical context, namely, under the Soviet dictatorship between 1945 and 1985. To understand teachers' emotions in Soviet classroom photographs, we were assisted by 13 teacher manuals of the time, as well as findings from studies into teachers' emotions conveyed in other countries, and particularly the research done by Zembylas, Landahl, Fried, Mansfield, and Dobozy.⁷⁵

⁷⁴ Schutz, “Inquiry on Teachers' Emotion”; Nagy, “History of Emotions.”

⁷⁵ Zembylas, “Emotions and Teacher Identity”; Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling”; “Learning to Listen and Look: The Shift from the Monitorial System of Education to Teacher-led Lessons”; Fried, Mansfield, and Dobozy, “Teacher Emotion Research.”

In view of these considerations, we came to the following conclusions.

Teachers see and evaluate themselves through others and, while trying to meet expectations at all levels of power, publicly present themselves as disciplined professionals. This is achieved by control over emotions and is evidenced by straight, static posture, frozen facial expressions, and lack of gestures among teachers posing for official class photographs. When “teaching,” the teacher shows doubt and critique while disciplining the class, thus, self-justifying her anxiety and nervousness. A smile or kind expression may adorn the teacher’s face, but more often than not, it remains serious, and the entire teacher image expresses emotional silence.

Although the emotional experience of men and women is different⁷⁶ and “codified within a given culture,”⁷⁷ female teachers mostly follow the example of their male colleagues to dispel any suspicion of the female body as a “repository of emotion”⁷⁸ and “naturally hysterical”.⁷⁹ Thus, the female teacher publicly demonstrates her professionalism and, like the male teacher, adopts the image of a soldier or policeman.

As demonstrated through emotions captured in classroom photos, the identity of Soviet teachers is fully in line with the one of the New Soviet Man inculcated by the authorities. However, studies of teachers’ emotions in other countries call into question the uniqueness of the Soviet teacher’s emotional image, a specificity we were convinced of at the beginning of this study. We must recognize that the external control of authoritarian power coincided with “internalized self-regulation”⁸⁰ which, as researchers into teachers’ emotions claim, has been demanded of teachers by all power at all times. Teacher’s “de-emotionalization” has deep roots in the history of education, and can be perceived both in US and European schools in a variety of political contexts.⁸¹ Since the professionalization of the teaching profession, teacher identity and, consequently, teachers’ emotions have been under the supervision of various levels of power represented by state, religious community, public opinion, and parents. Vigilant eyes have been kept on teachers as they have shaped students’ emotional experiences⁸² with their own emotions. The emotions taught at school later stand in good stead in further adult emotional communities – “the fatherland and the religious community”⁸³

⁷⁶ Reinhard Pekrun et al., “The Control-Value Theory of Achievement Emotions: An Integrative Approach to Emotions in Education,” in *Emotion in Education*, ed. Paul A. Schutz and Reinhard Pekrun (Amsterdam ao: Academic Press, 2007), 30.

⁷⁷ Robyn Barnacle, “Gut Instinct: The Body and Learning,” *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 41, no. 1 (2009): 29.

⁷⁸ Megan Boler, *Feeling Power*, 31.

⁷⁹ Megan Boler, *Feeling Power*, 43.

⁸⁰ Megan Boler, *Feeling Power*, 36.

⁸¹ Megan Boler, *Feeling Power*, 114.

⁸² Fried, Mansfield, and Dobozy, “Teacher Emotion Research,” 432.

⁸³ Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling,” 115.

to use the lexis of the nineteenth century, a time when the teaching profession began to professionalize, and outlines of “decent” emotions entered teaching manuals.⁸⁴

Nevertheless, emotional silence is dictated less by a certain historical, sociocultural, and political context, and more by a specific professional identity of the disciplined, rational, and masculine “real” teacher. The rules of emotional behavior are ingrained in the teaching profession, and these rules are surprisingly similar regardless of certain contexts, whose importance is emphasized in emotion research. Thus, we believe that the teacher-soldier, who is as solemn as the Kremlin, is welcomed, well-received and adapted by many political systems.

Bibliography

- Babansky, J. K., ed. *Pedagogika* [Pedagogy]. Moscow: Prosvesceniye, 1983.
- Baranov, S. P., et al. *Pedagogika* [Pedagogy]. Moscow: Prosvesceniye, 1981.
- Barnacle, Robyn. “Gut Instinct: The Body and Learning.” *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 41, no. 1 (2009): 22–33.
- Boler, Megan. *Feeling Power. Emotions and Education*. New York, London: Routledge, 1999.
- Braster, Sjaak. “Educational Change and Dutch Classroom Photographs. A Qualitative and Quantitative Analysis.” In *The Black Box of Schooling. A Cultural History of the Classroom*, edited by Sjaak Braster, Ian Grosvenor, and María del Mar Del Pozo, 21–38. Bruxelles: Peter Lang, 2011.
- Burke, Peter. *Eyewitnessing. The Use of Images as Historical Evidence*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 2001.
- Calhoun, Gloria. “Saints into Soviets: Russian Orthodox Symbolism and Soviet Political Posters” MA diss., Georgia State University, 2014, https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1089&context=history_theses. (accessed May 7, 2021)
- Davey, Gerald J. “Understanding Photographic Representation: Method and Meaning in the Interpretation of Photographs.” PhD diss., University of Iowa, 1992.
- Deldén, Maria. “The Teacher and Educational Spaces: The Photograph as a Tool for Teacher Reflection.” In *Engaging with Educational Space. Visualizing Spaces of Teaching and Learning*, edited by Catherine Burke, Ian Grosvenor, and Björn Norlin, 51–59. Umeå: Department of Historical, Philosophical and Religious Studies, 2014.
- Fried, Leanne, Mansfield, Caroline, and Dobozy, Eva. “Teacher Emotion Research: Introducing a Conceptual Model to Guide Future Research.” *Issues in Educational Research* 25, no. 4 (2015): 415–441.
- Gradszkova, Yulia. *Soviet People with Female Bodies: Performing Beauty and Maternity in Soviet Russia in the Mid 1930–1960s*. Stockholm: Stockholm University, 2007.
- Grosvenor, Ian. “On Visualising Past Classrooms.” In *Silences and Images: The Social History of the Classroom*, edited by Ian Grosvenor, Martin Lawn, and Kate Rousmaniere, 85–97. New York: Peter Lang, 1999.

84 See Landahl, “Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling,”

- Grosvenor, Ian. "To Act on the Minds of the Children' Paintings into Schools and English Education." In *The Black Box of Schooling. A Cultural History of the Classroom*, edited by Sjaak Braster, Ian Grosvenor, and María del Mar Del Pozo, 39–58. Bruxelles: Peter Lang, 2011.
- Hagedorn, Jörg. "Körper und Raum. Raumerschliessungs- und Raumeneignungsprozesse Jugendlicher in narrativen Selbstpraxen." In *Räume bilden – pädagogische Perspektiven auf den Raum*, edited by Constanze Berndt, Klaudia Kalish, und Anja Krüger, 147–156. Bad Heilbrunn: Verlag Julius Klinkhardt, 2016.
- Hewitt, Martin. "Bio-Politics and Social Policy: Foucault's Account of Welfare." In *The Body. Social Process and Cultural Theory*, edited by Mike Featherstone, Mike Helpworth, and Bryan S. Turner, 225–255. London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1991/2001.
- Hultkrantz, Catharina. "Beneath the Great Dome: Photographs as Means in the Study of the Senses and Emotions of Day-to-Day School Life." In *Engaging with Educational Space. Visualizing Spaces of Teaching and Learning*, edited by Catherine Burke, Ian Grosvenor, and Björn Norlin, 99–108. Umeå: Department of Historical, Philosophical and Religious Studies, 2014.
- Ilyina, Tatjana. *Pedagogika. Ucebnoje posobije dlja studentov pedagogiceskih institutov*. Moscow: Prosvescenije, 1969.
- Itogi vsesojuznoi perepisi naselenija 1959 goda. Latvijskaja SSR*. Moscow: Gosstatizdat CSU SSSR, 1963.
- Jesipovs, B.P., et al. *Pedagoģija*. Riga: Latvijas Valsts izdevniecība, 1948.
- Jesupov, B.P., i Goncarov, N.K. *Pedagogika*. Moscow: Ucpedizdat, 1950.
- Kestere, Iveta, and Kalke, Baiba. "Controlling the Image of the Teacher's Body under Authoritarianism: The Case of Soviet Latvia (1953–1984)." *Paedagogica Historica* 54, no. 1–2 (2018): 184–203.
- Kestere, Iveta, and Kalke, Baiba. "The Visual Image of the Teachers: A Ten-Country Perspective." *Revista Columbiana de Educación* 68 (2015): 19–40.
- Kestere, Iveta, Wolhuter, Charl, and Lozano, Ricardo, eds. *The Visual Image of the Teacher: International Comparative Perspectives*. Riga: RaKa, 2012.
- Kovaljov, N.J., et al. *Vvedenije v pedagogiku*. Moscow: Prosvescenije, 1975.
- Landahl, Joakim. "Emotions, Power and the Advent of Mass Schooling." *Paedagogica Historica* 51, no. 1–2 (February–April 2015): 104–116.
- Landahl, Joakim. "Learning to Listen and Look: the Schift from the Monitorial System of Education to Teacher-led Lessons." *The Senses and Society* 14, no. 2 (2019): 194–206.
- Latvijas Nacionālā bibliotēka. *Zudusī Latvija senos zīmējumos, atklātnēs un fotogrāfijās no 19.gs. beigām līdz mūsdienām*, <http://www.zudusilatvija.lv/>. (accessed May 7, 2021)
- Lazda, Mara Irene. "Gender and Totalitarianism: Soviet and Nazi Occupations of Latvia (1940–1945)." PhD diss., Indiana University, 2005.
- Lhomme, Margaux, and Marsella, Stacy C. "Expressing Emotion Through Posture and Gesture." In *The Oxford Handbook of Affective Computing*, edited by Rafael Calvo, Sidney D'Mello, Jonathan Gratch, and Arvid Kappas, 273–285. Oxford University Press, 2014. DOI: 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199942237.013.039.
- Medinskij, J.N. *Prosvescenije v SSSR*. Moscow: Gos. Ucebno-pedagogiceskoje izdatelstvo, 1955.
- Mortari, Luigina. "Emotions and Education: Reflecting on the Emotional Experience." *European Journal of Educational Research* 4, no. 4 (October 2015): 157–176.
- Nagy, Piroška. "History of Emotions." In *Debating New Approaches to History*, edited by Marek Tamm, and Peter Burke, 189–215. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2019.
- Osterhammel, Jürgen. "Global History." In *Debating New Approaches to History*, edited by Marek Tamm, and Peter Burke, 21–47. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2019.

- Pekrun, Reinhard, et al. “The Control-Value Theory of Achievement Emotions: An Integrative Approach to Emotions in Education.” In *Emotion in Education*, edited by Paul A. Schutz, and Reinhard Pekrun, 3–36. Amsterdam: Academic Press, 2007.
- Prozorov, Sergei. “The Biopolitics of Stalinism: Ideas and Bodies in Soviet Governmentality.” *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political* 38, no. 3 (August 2013): 208–227.
- Sauter, Disa A., McDonald, Nicole M., Gangi, Devon N., and Messinger, Daniel S. “Nonverbal Expressions of Positive Emotions.” In *Handbook of Positive Emotions*, edited by Michele M. Tugade, Michelle N. Shiota, and Leslie D. Kirby, 179–198. New York/London: Guilford Press, 2014.
- Schutz, Paul A. “Inquiry on Teachers’ Emotion.” *Educational Psychologist* 49, no. 1 (2014): 1–12.
- Schutz, Paul A., and Pekru, Reinhard, eds. *Emotion in Education*. Amsterdam a.o.: Academic Press, 2007.
- Schwartz, Joan M. “Negotiating the Visual Turn: New Perspectives on Images and Archives.” *American Archivist* 47, no. 1 (2004): 107–122.
- Scott, James C. *Domination and the Arts of Resistance*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1990.
- Sontag, Susan. *On Photography*. New York: RosettaBooks LLC, 1973/2005.
- Strods, Henrihs. *PSRS politiskā cenzūra Latvijā 1940–1990*. Rīga: Jumava, 2010.
- Vails, Pjotrs, un Geniss, Aleksandrs. *60.gadi. Padomju cilvēka pasaule*. Rīga: Jumava, 2006.
- Weiner, Reinhard. “Examining Emotional Diversity in the Classroom: An Attribution Theorist Considers the Moral Emotions.” In *Emotion in Education*, edited by Paul A. Schutz, and Reinhard Pekrun, 75–88. Amsterdam: Academic Press, 2007.
- Zembylas, Michalionos. “Emotions and Teacher Identity: a Poststructural Perspective.” *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice* 9, no. 3 (August 2003): 213–238.