Malcolm D. Lambert

Catharism as a Reform Movement

Catharism appeared and presented itself to adherents as a reform, claiming from the twelfth century to its demise to be, in its adepts, a reliving of the life of the apostles. Everwin of Steinfeld in 1143–1144 quotes the early Cathars as saying that they were “the true imitators of the apostolic life ... possessing no houses, or lands, or anything of their own, even as Christ had no property nor allowed his disciples the right of possession”. We, the poor of Christ, they are quoted as saying, “... are persecuted as were the apostles and martyrs, despite the fact that we lead a most strict and holy life, persevering day and night in fasts and abstinence, in prayers and in labour from which we seek only the necessities of life ...”¹. The Provençal Vindication of the Church of God, composed after 1240, makes a similar claim to be the true Church of God because of its ethical life, describing their own, Cathar Church as holy and unblemished and arguing that it “received such power from our Lord Jesus Christ that sins are pardoned by its prayer”² and going on chapter by chapter to list its ethical achievements, in refraining from killing, adultery, theft, lying, oaths and blasphemy³. “It keeps and observes”, the source claimed, “all the commandments of the law of life” and it “suffers persecutions”⁴. The parallel between the description in Everwin and the Vindication is plain, excepting only that the Vindication stresses persecution more and poverty less as a mark of the true Church.

The voiding of the power of the Roman Church because of its ethical failings and its supersession by the Cathar Church because it observed the apostolic life and suffered persecution, while the Roman Church did not runs as a theme through Cathar history. The view can be seen in action in the inquisitorial records of Cathar activity in the county of Foix at the very end of Cathar history. Ethics and the apostolic life guaranteed the authenticity of Cathar faith. Raimond Garsen, for example, repeating the message of Pierre Autier and his missionaries,

¹ Heresies of the High Middle Ages, ed. *Walter L. Wakefield, Austin P. Evans* (New York, London 1967) 129; hereafter cited as WEH; Migne PL 182, 676–680.

² WEH, 597; *Théo Venckeleer*, *Un recueil cathare: le manuscrit A.6.10 de la collection vauchoise de Dublin, I: une apologie; II: une glose sur le pater* in: RBPH 38 (1960) 820–831; 39 (1961) 762–785; this ref *supra*, 822.

³ WEH, 599, 600, 601; RBPH 38 (1960) 823, 824, 825, 826.

⁴ WEH, 602, 603; RBPH 38 (1960) 827, 828.

said that the perfect, the Cathar élite, were good Christians and possessed a good faith, and that by their faith and no other could man be saved⁵. Pierre Autier and his brother Guillaume, freshly returned from being consoled in Lombardy, sought to persuade their brother Raimond that their way of life reproduced that of the apostles, i.e., Peter and Paul – for they did not swear oaths or lie, they did not eat meat, cheese or eggs and practised great abstinences and fasts⁶. Blanche de Rodes recalled the perfect teaching that the Roman Church had no power with God because it lied and killed and encouraged every kind of evil, that nobody in a state of sin had the power of absolving but the perfect followed the way of God and so had this power⁷. Olivi, recalling the tribulation suffered by the Church through the Cathars, listed the reasons for their success, and, significantly, put first their rejection of the authority of the Church and its replacement by that of the perfect on ethical grounds that is, because of their sanctity, which Olivi dismissed as hypocritical⁸. To their hearers the perfect claimed that they were sinless⁹.

Amongst the small artisans and traders investigated by inquisitors in Bologna between 1291 and 1310, it was the holiness and miracles of the perfect contrasted with the moral deficiencies of Roman clergy and friars which held the movement together and led potential adherents to move on from diffused grumbling about the clergy in the workshops where heresy was spread on to a total dismissal of the Roman Church as the *ecclesia malignantium* and its supersession by the Church of the perfect¹⁰. The pattern was that of the New Testament, as they interpreted it.

The prayer of the Cathars was the Paternoster, said in swathes by the perfect – up to 250 per day, according to Borst¹¹. Its importance is stressed in Catharism since even to speak it was prohibited to the ordinary adherent – a special ceremony, the Delivery of the Prayer, was required before authorisation to use the Pater was given¹². In the rituals which have come down to us that ceremony preceded the laying on of hands whereby the trained candidate was given the consolamentum and attained the ranks of the perfect. Probably, in the case of a healthy, rather than a dying candidate for the consolamentum, the Delivery of the Prayer

⁵ L'inquisiteur Geoffroy d'Ablis et les Cathares du Comté de Foix (1308–1309), texte édité, traduit et annoté par Annette Pales-Gobilliard (Paris 1984) 362; hereafter cited as PG.

⁶ PG 118.

⁷ PG 228.

⁸ Ignaz v. Döllinger, Beiträge zur Sektengeschichte des Mittelalters II (München 1890) 556–557.

⁹ PG 263, 293.

¹⁰ Lorenzo Paolini, L'eresia a Bologna fra XIII e XIV secolo I L'eresia catara all a fine del duecento (Rome 1975) 167–172, hereafter cited as Paolini, L'eresia; *Id.*, Domus e zona degli eretici. L'esempio di Bologna nel XIII secolo in: RSC1 35 (1981) 371–387, at 385–387; on miracles, Mariano d'Alatri, Culto dei santi ed eretici in Italia nei secoli XII e XIII in: *Id.*, Eretici e Inquisitori I (Rome 1986) 23–43.

¹¹ Arno Borst, Die Katharer (MGH Schriften 12, Stuttgart 1953) 191; hereafter cited as Borst.

¹² Gerhard Rottenwöhrer, Der Katharismus II (1) Der Kult, die religiöse Praxis, die Kritik an Kult und Sakramenten der Katholischen Kirche. Der Kult (Bad Honnef 1982) 86–144; hereafter cited as RK. I am indebted to the author for advice and bibliography. Borst, 192.

was a kind of pre-consolamentum, a crucial stage in the candidate's acceptance into the Cathar elite, preceding in time the consolamentum proper, and presupposing its subsequent administration to the candidate¹³. The Paternoster was understood to be the regular song of praise of the angels in heaven, which had been forgotten by the angels who fell to the earth and were imprisoned by Satan, and was brought back to mankind by Christ and through the Cathar Church restored to the perfect's use, who in the ceremony of the consolamentum renounced meat, marriage, and the products of coition and promised to observe an unflinching good life.

In the final part of the ritual a book was placed on the candidate's head and laying on of hands administered the consolamentum and enrolled him or her in the ranks of the perfect. Here the New Testament had a vital role. In one account, based on Italian experience, the whole New Testament or a gospel book is held out by the perfect administering the consolamentum to the candidate who takes it and holds it to his or her breast. The perfect then says "You have now received the Testament in which is recorded the divine law. Never, for all time, may it leave your heart" and, after further exchanges, places it on the candidate's head¹⁴. A similar procedure is recorded in the extant Latin and Provençal rituals¹⁵. Peter Biller has reminded us how often a text of the gospel of John or of the whole New Testament would have appeared amongst Cathar supporters because of the part the text played in the ritual of the consolamentum¹⁶. Most commonly the consolamentum was administered to the dying: every such gathering, often nocturnal in the later days of persecution, would bring over the vital importance of the text of Scripture at the most solemn moment of a Cathar's life. The laying of a gospel book on the head has a quasi-magical quality about it. It corresponds exactly to the ceremony of consoling among the Bogomils described in the early twelfth century by Euthymius Zigabenus¹⁷. Fichtenau suggests that Bogomils believed that in this way the gospel entered into, and purified the candidate; Cathars may well have held the same view¹⁸.

Texts from the New Testament supported the movement. Everwin describes how at Cologne, when a Cathar group was being broken up, a bishop and his as-

¹³ RK II (1) 143 suggests an interval of time between the Delivery and the consolamentum, but does not believe that the ritual created a special status, lying between rank and file believer, and the perfect. *Jean Duvernoy* in his translation, *Le registre d'Inquisition de Jacques Fournier évêque de Pamiers 1318–1325* III (Paris, La Haye, New York 1978) 1162 n. 10 argues for a progressive initiation of a candidate in the abstinences.

¹⁴ WEH, 366 from Anselm of Alessandria, *Tractatus de hereticis*, ed. *Antoine Dondaine*, *La hiérarchie cathare en Italie*, in: AFP 20 (1950) 308–324, at 314.

¹⁵ RK II (1) 222.

¹⁶ *Peter Biller*, *The Cathars of Languedoc and Written Materials*, in: *Heresy and Literacy, 1000–1530*, ed. *Peter Biller, Anne Hudson* (Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature 23, Cambridge 1994) 61–82, at 74; hereafter cited as *Biller, Hudson*.

¹⁷ *Dimetri Obolensky*, *The Bogomils* (Cambridge 1948) 215, hereafter cited as *Obolensky*.

¹⁸ *Heinrich Fichtenau*, *Ketzer und Professoren. Häresie und Vernunftglaube im Hochmittelalter* (München 1992) 90.

sistant held their ground “defending their heresy with the words of Christ and of the Apostle”¹⁹. Scriptural texts run through the classic Cathar texts as well as the rituals and reports of sermons of the perfect in judicial records. Lorenzo Paolini argues that it was the Cathars rather than the Catholics who first produced *summae auctoritatum*, collections of passages supporting their case mainly from Scripture, leading the Catholics to do likewise in their own interest²⁰. At Labécède c. 1236–7 the Cathars used a scribe and public notary to hold a reading of the Passion, presumably to provide a guarantee of authenticity. Scripture occupied a central role on the occasion, flanked on one side by a sermon from one of the perfect and on the other by the adoring of the perfect by the rank and file through the ceremony of the *melioramentum*²¹.

The emphasis on the New Testament, the cutting away of all prayers save the Paternoster, the insistence on New Testament ethics, the rejection of church buildings all represented a simplifying and clarifying process. A strong sense of the needless obfuscation of the Roman clergy, muddying what is simple, comes over in the Cathar treatise reconstructed by Thouzellier from the polemic of Durand of Huesca. “O senseless men of learning ... O blind leaders of the blind, what can be plainer in Holy Scriptures?”²² The same sentiment is at work in the attacks on liturgy and chants and in contemptuous references to the Mass. All that was true in it, Jacques Autier said, was the gospel and the Paternoster²³.

The rituals reflect one of the deepest feelings of the Cathars, that they represented a stream of pure Christianity preserved from the days of Christ. They did not see themselves as inventors of novelties but as faithful conservers of tradition²⁴. The baptism of John was with water; that of Christ a baptism of spirit by laying on of hands. The one, for most Cathars, was the work of Satan, the other the work of Christ transmitted to his followers. In the words of the Provençal Ritual, “This holy baptism by which the Holy Spirit is given, the Church of God has preserved from the apostles until this time and it has passed from Good Men to Good Men until the present time.”²⁵ The Latin Ritual is more polemical. “No wise man”, it says, “believes that the Church of Jesus Christ performs this baptism by imposition of hands without manifest proof from Scripture...”²⁶. The rite itself had full efficacy. It restored the fallen angel in the believer’s body to freedom

¹⁹ WEH, 128, Migne PL 182, 676–80.

²⁰ Lorenzo Paolini, Italian Catharism and Written Culture, in: *Biller, Hudson*, 83–103, at 92.

²¹ Peter Biller in: *Biller, Hudson* (supra, n. 16) 75, citing Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris, Collection Doat 23, fol. 98r.

²² WEH, 506; *Christine Thouzellier*, Un Traité cathare inédit du début du XIII^e siècle d’après le liber contra Manicheos de Durand de Huesca (Louvain 1961) 104–105.

²³ Le registre d’Inquisition de Jacques Fournier évêque de Pamiers (1318–1325), publié avec introduction et notes par *Jean Duvernoy* (Toulouse 1965) III, 133; hereafter cited as JF.

²⁴ RK II (1) 194.

²⁵ WEH, 489; see *Léon Clédât*, Le Nouveau Testament traduit au XIII^e siècle en langue provençale suivi d’un rituel cathare (Paris 1887).

²⁶ WEH, 476; see *Christine Thouzellier*, Rituel cathare: Introduction, texte critique, traduction et notes (Sources chrétiennes 236, Paris 1977).

from the power of Satan: if the perfect then maintained the prohibitions of the Cathar way of life unerringly, salvation was assured.

How much ethics mattered for the appeal of the early Cathars in the Rhineland has been demonstrated by Everwin of Steinfeld; André Vauchez's recent drawing of information from a sermon of Archbishop Federico Visconti on the coming of Catharism to Languedoc points in the same direction²⁷. The Archbishop, doubtless relying on oral tradition from Pisan merchants trading in the area, reminded his listeners that Cathars established a popular base because they had succeeded in persuading the nobles of the mountains to cut their depredations on caravans carrying textiles from France to the ports of Montpellier and Marseilles and to modify their sexual practices to the extent of at least renouncing adultery. It was an ethical appeal which gave missionaries a springboard. The story, late as it is in written form, fits the pattern of levying of tolls on the textile trade, is congruent with what we know about the hard resistance of the men of the mountains to the Albigensian Crusade, and is broadly of a piece with the regnant hypothesis of Griffe on the reasons for early Cathar success in the region based on the appeal of preachers of a spiritualised Church with limited material demands for an impoverished local nobility, chafing at the loss of tithes and ecclesiastical revenues²⁸. Moral and social issues more than doctrinal ones mattered.

The application of the term Patarine to the Cathars of Italy no doubt owes something to the violent attack of Landulph Senior on the radical but orthodox reform movement of the Pataria in eleventh century Milan, in which he stigmatised all strands of support for the Pataria as subversive, and came close to accusing them of heresy²⁹. The stages whereby this nomenclature, obscure in origin and labile in use, came to be the term of art for Italian Catharism can never now be traced but we may see some significance in the continued use after Landulph in an orthodox source of the term Patarine as a term of praise for a species of moral determination³⁰.

Catharism in Italy was predominantly a city movement, in which a potent blend of moral irritation and political demands on Popes and bishops kept heresy alive. It benefitted from perennial tensions over property rights, abuses of law and authority and deficiencies of the upper and wealthier clergy, and from struggles between bishops and communes.

Mary Henderson on Orvieto, though modifying Fumi's excessive concentration on a few prominent Ghibelline families as Cathar supporters, nonetheless

²⁷ *André Vauchez*, *Les origines de l'hérésie cathare en Languedoc, d'après un sermon de l'archevêque de Pise Federico Visconti (†1277)*, in: *Società, Istituzioni, Spiritualità, Studi in onore di Cinzio Violante II* (Centro Italiano di Studi sull' alto medioevo, Spoleto 1994) 1023–1036. I owe the reference to Dr L. Panarelli.

²⁸ *Elie Griffe*, *Les débuts de l'aventure cathare en Languedoc (1140–1190)* (Paris 1969) ch. 7.

²⁹ *Giorgio Cracco*, *Pataria: opus e nomen (tra verità e autorità)* in: *RSC1* 18 (1974) 357–387.

³⁰ *Guglielmo*, *Vita Benedicti abbatis Clusensis*, ed. *Ludwig Bethmann*, in: *MGH SS XII* (1856) 205.

argues for a relation between peaks of political unrest and Cathar success³¹. It is a commonplace that Catharism developed during the conflict between Barbarossa and the Popes. Manselli neatly describes Papal attitudes towards communes in the twelfth century as a disconcerting mixture of imperious command and incredible weakness; reaction against Papal policy led directly to toleration of heretics³². Although there seems to be no evidence that the followers of Arnold of Brescia long survived his execution or that the Pataria as an organised force continued in existence, such movements yet left behind residual attitudes, a tendency to sharp criticism of the wealth and power of the clergy and to moral rigidity and intransigence, on which Cathar missionaries could build. Again, it was a predominantly ethical appeal which won support.

Merlo, reflecting on the history of Cathar heresy in Vicenza before Ezzelino da Romano, notes that the city, which became the seat of a Cathar bishopric, is one in which two Catholic bishops were assassinated within twenty years and sees a conjunction of factors there and in other cities as peculiarly potent for the growth of Catharism – an underlying religious fervour which found insufficient orthodox outlet, together with political disturbances and a crisis of diocesan ecclesiastical institutions³³. Cathar success in Italy rested on a fluctuating alliance of Ghibellines, of reformers, of those interested in civic independence, of rank and file enthusiasts and of a core of perfect who used the language of reform but through their novitiate had acquired a training in the ritual and ethical requirements of their status together with a deeper immersion in dualist beliefs, not so readily available to ordinary sympathisers.

The will to reform remained an important element and this is illustrated by the cases in which Cathar sympathisers made headway in Catholic confraternities or apparently found themselves unable to choose between the two religions. D'Alatri believed that one of the most important motives for becoming a Cathar in thirteenth century Italy was the desire for a deeper, more personal religious experience, too often unsatisfied by the preoccupations of the medieval Church, and if this experience was available from a Cathar teacher, then it was Catharism which would capture the enthusiast³⁴. Volpe long ago believed that Cathar supporters'

³¹ J. Mary Henderson, *Piety and Heresy in Medieval Orvieto: The Religious Life of the Laity, c. 1150–1350* (Ph.D. thesis, University of Edinburgh 1990) 57, 118, cited hereafter as Henderson; I am indebted to Rev. J. Mary Henderson for generously allowing access to her unpublished thesis. Luigi Fumi, *I Paterini in Orvieto*, in: *Archivio Storico Italiano* ser. 3, 22 (1875) 52–81.

³² Raoul Manselli, *L'eresia del Male* (Naples 1963) 278.

³³ Grado Merlo, *Un contributo sulla storia ereticale a Vicenza nel Duecento*, in: *Ricerche di Storia sociale e religiosa* 39 (1991) 201–209, reviewing Francesco Lomastro Tognato, *L'eresia a Vicenza nel Duecento. Dati, problemi e fonti* (Fonti e Studi di Storia Veneta 12, Vicenza 1988); see also *Storia di Vicenza II, Età medievale*, ed. Giorgio Cracco (Vicenza 1991). I am indebted for bibliographical help to Dr Daniela Rando and Professor Merlo.

³⁴ Mariano D'Alatri, *L'inquisizione in Italia negli anni 1250–1274*, in: *Id.*, *Eretici e inquisitori in Italia. Studi e documenti, I Il Duecento* (Rome 1986) 127–138, at 138, cited hereafter as DAI; Manselli, *L'eresia*, 267–270.

circles and mendicant third orders appealed to the same sorts of people, and those responsible for the statutes of confraternities showed a sometimes justified awareness of the dangers of being infiltrated by heresy³⁵. Spera, maid of honour to the Marchesa of Este, burnt about 1269 for Catharism, in her comment in the prison at Verona awaiting execution, leads D'Alatri to reflect, justly, that it was simply an unlucky chance that she had been hereticated by the Cathar Armano Pungiluppo of Ferrara rather than entering into a Catholic confraternity³⁶. Domenico di Pietro Rosse, a Franciscan tertiary and man of substance in Orvieto, was for years simultaneously in the third order and active as a Cathar supporter, guiding the perfect to and fro, listening to their teaching and giving them the melioramentum without feeling it needful to choose between the two³⁷. He was not a double agent like Pungiluppo, who was high in the councils of the Cathars and yet passed himself off as a Catholic, or Pierre Clergue the parish priest of Montailhou who was deeply involved in Catharism, and his penance of fasting and abstinence, clothing the poor, of saying fifty Paters and Aves every day and confessing three times a year to a Franciscan acknowledges the fact.

Some recruits may have been too young and ill-instructed to know what they were doing. We may believe Bonaventura di S. Giorgio di Verona who had been induced to give the melioramentum to a heretic when he was young and later explained that he did not understand what he was doing³⁸. A simple woman in Orvieto, Bonadimane, had been a witness for a canonisation process yet was later convicted as a Cathar supporter³⁹. What had attracted her plainly was holiness, as she saw it, either in a Catholic or a Cathar, and indeed much of the lasting attraction of Catharism lay in the mysterious and fascinating position of the perfect whose very dress in days of freedom was designed to set them off from the Catholic clergy and whose statements and titles, such as *boni homines*, put forward a claim and a programme.

Cases of dual allegiance, though rare, throw into relief the confusions and uncertainties of many others who in an uninstructed, emotional fashion, grasped at the means of salvation, whether through a Catholic friar or a Cathar perfect. Catharism was in a sense born in Donatism: once faith in ecclesiastical authority had been lost through real or exaggerated faults in the clergy, support would be sought by the seeker after salvation elsewhere, and the perfect, with their confidence, their claim to an arduous way of life and their title to be the sole mediators of salvation, filled the bill.

³⁵ Mariano D'Alatri, 'Ordo paenitentium' ed eresia in Italia, in: DAI, 45–63, at 50–52. *Gioacchino Volpe*, *Movimenti religiosi e sette ereticali nella società medioevale Italiana (secoli XI–XIV)* (Firenze, 2, 1961) 170.

³⁶ Mariano D'Alatri, *Eresie perseguite dall'inquisizione*, in: DAI, 9–22, at 14; Muratori, V, 126 DE.

³⁷ D'Alatri in: DAI, 45–7 (supra, n. 35). *Henderson*, 92–94, 247–248 (transcription of his sentence), 325.

³⁸ D'Alatri, in: DAI, 14 (supra, n. 37). Muratori, V, 122 D.

³⁹ *Henderson*, 11, 131.

Of the authenticity of the renunciations of the perfect, of their observance of the food tabus and fasting, we can feel, by and large, assured, since the perfect lived too close to their supporters in the villages and castra of Languedoc or the Italian cities and worked in too many and varied occupations, involving contact with the public, as Duvernoy has taught us⁴⁰, to have been able to deceive. The occasional sexual scandals reported in a well-informed source such as the *Tractatus de hereticis* of Anselm of Alessandria or the manoeuvring of Béliaste with his mistress do not undermine the generalisation⁴¹. Pseudo-Capelli's defence of Cathar morality carries conviction⁴². So long as the quality of life of the perfect remained intact, their presence would continue to draw supporters.

Anticlericalism and scepticism were also weapons to be turned against the Catholic doctrine and ritual in which both teacher and taught would have been reared. Pierre Autier's revival, because of the conscientiousness of the inquisition of Geoffrey D'Ablis and the passion for detail of Jacques Fournier is the ideal context in which to study Cathar missionary technique in action: fragmentary evidence from earlier days and other mission fields confirms that Autier used approaches common to Cathars elsewhere, albeit with an uncommon skill, for he was an evangelist of powerful character⁴³. Meeting potential recruits, he was first of all concerned to break down and ridicule the practices which held together the Catholic calendar, so as to replace them by a rival Cathar structure of custom, focussed on the perfect. At a first meal with the student Pierre de Luzenac Autier expressed his disapproval when Pierre crossed himself before the meal⁴⁴. In response to a query he ridiculed the practice of crossing oneself before entering the church. It was suitable for brushing away flies in summer, he said: if they made the sign they could say "Here is the forehead and here is the beard and here is the ear and here is the other."⁴⁵ His audience laughed. Pierre de Gaillac remembered Pierre and his son Jacques preaching and arguing that the cross should never be used as a sign, drawing the analogy with the attitude of parents towards the wood

⁴⁰ *Jean Duvernoy*, Les Albigeois dans la vie sociale et économique de leur temps, in: Actes du colloque de Toulouse, Annales de l'Institut d'Etudes occitanes (Toulouse 1963) 3–11. I owe help to the author.

⁴¹ *Malcolm Lambert*, Medieval Heresy. Popular Movements from the Gregorian Reform to the Reformation (Oxford, Cambridge [USA], 2, 1992) 125–131. JF II 31, III 188–193, 198. ⁴² WEH, 301–306, at 305. The faulty ed. by *Dino Buzzocchi* has been corrected by *W. L. Wakefield*.

⁴³ *Jean-Marie Vidal*, Les derniers ministres de l'Albigéisme en Languedoc; leurs doctrines in: RQH 79 (1906) 57–107, Doctrine et morale des derniers ministres albigeois, in: RQH 85 (1909) 357–409, 86 (1909) 5–48 is largely superseded on history by *Jean Duvernoy*, Le catharisme en Languedoc au début du XIV^e Siècle, in: Effacement du Catharisme? (XIII^e – XIV^e siècles) (Cahiers de Fanjeaux 20, Toulouse 1985) 27–56 and on doctrine by *Gerhard Rottenwöhler*, Der Katharismus IV (2), Glaube und Theologie der Katharer (Bad Honnef 1993) 156–369. See *Jean Duvernoy*, Pierre Autier, in: Cahiers d'études cathares 21 (1970) 9–49 together with the introduction to the register of Geoffrey D'Ablis by *Annette Pales-Gobilliard* in: PG 1–77.

⁴⁴ PG 372.

⁴⁵ JF II 422.

of a gallows where their son had been hanged⁴⁶. Arnaud Issaurat was told that it ought to be spat upon⁴⁷.

Confession was denigrated in an anecdotal fashion, on the assumption that priests betrayed the secrets of the confessional and made jokes⁴⁸. Baptism of infants was dismissed as valueless, on grounds in which dualism, rationalism and hostile anecdote all played a part. The water on dualist lines was described as the water of the mire of corruption in contrast to the water of the spirit, which was the word of God⁴⁹. It was rejected because infants could not make decisions, in implicit contrast to the species of adult baptism of the *consolamentum*⁵⁰. Sibille Peire remembered the ritual dialogue in baptism between priest and godparents being described by Pierre Autier as lies. They said for the baby: I wish to be baptised, yet the baby did not so wish and cried⁵¹. Guillelme Garsen remembered being told that baptism might as well take place in the river Aude⁵². Arnaud Piquier recalled being told either by Pierre or Jacques Autier how one of them had taken a child to baptism and had found that it had died of cold because of the water in the font⁵³. The perfect said that the Catholic images of saints were idols⁵⁴.

So the negatives about Catholicism, rationalist demystification, hostile anecdotes, ridicule, piled up, drip-fed to recruits and adherents in conversation, by the fire, in formal preaching, on journeys.

Rationalism was both forerunner and accompaniment to the rites of Catharism: it broke down conformity to Catholicism. At no point was it more important than in relation to the mystery of the mass. On the one hand it was the centre of Sunday worship, and was a key point in the commemoration of the dead, in the requiem mass and in masses for the dead. On the other it was essential for the Cathar teacher to destroy reverence and affection for this rite so as to make way for his own teaching and ritual. The fundamental Docetism of the Cathar made the doctrine of Transubstantiation wholly unacceptable⁵⁵; yet the perfect do not seem to have made much use of arguments drawn from their own rejection of medieval orthodoxy on the person of Christ or from their repudiation of bread and wine as part of the evil creation of Satan. In preference, they utilised a casual, rationalist scepticism which our evidence suggests was neither invented nor developed by them but floated in society.

It was standard among Pierre Autier's team and their adherents to believe that the consecrated host was, and remained merely bread⁵⁶. In a homely analogy re-

⁴⁶ PG 336. See PG 228, JF II 410.

⁴⁷ PG 312.

⁴⁸ JF III 229.

⁴⁹ PG 336.

⁵⁰ PG 312.

⁵¹ JF II 410.

⁵² PG 190.

⁵³ PG 172.

⁵⁴ PG 250, 338.

⁵⁵ RK II (2) 800.

⁵⁶ e.g. PG 251.

called by Guillelme Garsen it was compared to the “oublies”, unconsecrated bread presented by children on the occasion of their New Year resolutions⁵⁷. Jacques Autier, instructing Pierre Maury, asked him in a *reductio ad absurdum* how the host could be the body of God when men handled it and it passed through the processes of digestion and so ended up in a latrine⁵⁸. Pierre and Guillaume Autier, talking to their brother Raimond and referring to the priest’s communion, said that God could not be divided up and eaten⁵⁹. Sibille Peire remembered Pierre Autier saying that there was only bread and wine in the sacrament of the altar after consecration as before and adding derisively that if it were the body of Christ and had been as large as mount Bugarach in Cubières, there were so many priests that they could have eaten it up and it would still not have been large enough⁶⁰. Gérard de Rodés remembered preaching in which it was pointed out that if a consecrated host were left where there were mice, they would eat it and so would, in the Catholic view, be eating the body of Christ⁶¹. Pierre de Gaillac was given a spiritualising interpretation of the bread and wine of the Last Supper: they were the Word of God⁶².

The sceptical arguments about the mass have a long history in Catharism. They were a commonplace in Italy as in Languedoc⁶³. They were picked up by the early controversialists, Alan of Lille, Durand of Huesca and Ébrard of Bethune and they appear in the sentences of Pierre Seila. In Italy both Moneta and the *Disputatio inter catholicum et paterinum* knew of them and they appear in the record of the trial of Armano Pungiluppo. Ekbert of Schönaue recorded that a Cathar suspect on his deathbed compared Christ’s body to the Hermelstein⁶⁴. Pierre de Vaux de Cernay at the time of the Albigensian Crusade recorded that the Cathars at that time said that the body must have been as big as the Alps⁶⁵. The arguments were a current feature of propaganda.

But they existed before the Cathars emerged, not, it would seem, as a consequence of the work of Berengar of Tours, although medieval authors, including Aquinas, attributed such views to him⁶⁶, but rather as the outflow of spontaneous popular scepticism. Fournier’s register gives significant information. Béatrice de Planisolles, despite being a slippery witness trying to dilute her complicity in Catharism, can probably be believed when she claimed that the slogan about Christ’s body, which she herself admitted using, first came to her attention when she heard

⁵⁷ PG 188.

⁵⁸ JF III 133.

⁵⁹ PG 119.

⁶⁰ JF II 411.

⁶¹ PG 104.

⁶² PG 336.

⁶³ RK II (2) 780–813; for the analogy of the mountain and stercorism in Italy, 798.

⁶⁴ PL 195, 92.

⁶⁵ *Historia Albigensis*, ed. P. Guébin, H. Maison/neuve (Paris 1926) I 13.

⁶⁶ Gary Macy, Berengar’s Legacy as Heresiarch, in: *Auctoritas und Ratio. Studien zu Berengar von Tours*, ed. P. Ganz, R. B. C. Huygens, F. Niewöhner (Wiesbaden 1990) 47–67.

a stonemason casually using it as he watched a crowd going into church for the elevation of the host⁶⁷.

No-one drew the net of investigation more tightly than Fournier. Elsewhere we may suspect that ignorance, disbelief and heresy can be underestimated because of the wish of defendants to escape accusations⁶⁸; in the cases of suspects brought before Fournier because of his pertinacity, that is much less likely. Fournier's investigation inevitably pulled in cases of spontaneous scepticism, unconnected with the Cathars. Aude Fauré had been brought to a disbelief in Transubstantiation as the result of one traumatic experience working on a highly nervous temperament⁶⁹. Fournier pressed her on a Cathar link, but the penance which he imposed, medicinal rather than punitive, involving with other obligations a personal interview with him every Corpus Christi Day, giving him the opportunity to vary or remit the penance, shows that he did not think that there was one⁷⁰. It was a spontaneous, personal disbelief.

Jean Rocas, who came before his court, though he had been touched by Catharism as well as materialism, was too idiosyncratic to be taken over by any organised group. He insisted on a non-Trinitarian formula of his own invention for crossing himself, "Deus adiuva me, qui fecit caelum et terram" and died excommunicated in prison because he would not abjure his belief that it was no sin to have sexual intercourse with a prostitute, provided that a fair price had been agreed⁷¹. Aude Fauré wanted to believe but could not. Jean Rocas was recalcitrant. Neither could have been raw material for the Cathar movement, but they indicate the type of case of individual disbelief which would be grist to the mill of a Cathar missionary.

So, too, do cases thrown up in the 1270's in areas where Cathars were not strong and inquisitors found no complicity with Catharism⁷². Durand de Ruffiaco de Olmeria, for example, believed that the soul was nothing other than the blood in the body, a non-Cathar view, and that if Christ's body were as big as a mountain, it would still have been eaten by the priests long ago⁷³. The peasant Bernardus de Soulhaco also used the analogy of the mountain, said that the host was nothing other than baked dough such as he had in good supply in his cupboard, and that one need confess sins only to God⁷⁴.

Similar sentiments, in tone and content, were expressed at various times by Waldensians and Lollards. Durand on the lack of necessity of sacramental confes-

⁶⁷ JF I 218.

⁶⁸ I owe this comment to Professor Kaspar Elm.

⁶⁹ JF II 82-105. Comment by *Leonard E. Boyle*, *Montaillou revisited: Mentalité and Methodology*, in: *Pathways to Medieval Peasants*, ed. *J. A. Raftis* (Toronto 1981) 119-140.

⁷⁰ JF II 103-105.

⁷¹ JF II 241-254.

⁷² *Walter L. Wakefield*, *Some Unorthodox Popular Ideas of the Thirteenth Century*, in: *Medievalia et Humanistica n.s.4* (1973) 25-35, based on the inquisition of the Dominicans Ranulph of Plassac and Pons of Parnac recorded in *Doat* 25, 26.

⁷³ Defendant from the diocese of Rodez, art.cit. 26.

⁷⁴ A peasant from the region of Montauban, delated by the Dominican prior of Montauban, art.cit. 27.

sion sounds exactly like a Lollard. Such views were stimulated by the opening of the Scriptures, by public or private reading of vernacular translations and by the teaching of leaders in reading-circles. Inquisitions also revealed fragments of disbelief that would normally have passed unnoticed by authority, stigmatised by JAF Thomson on Lollardy as “tavern unbelief”⁷⁵. There are interesting parallels between all three movements. Alice Rowley of the Coventry Lollards, when she denounced priests for obtaining hosts for a low price, then making a profit by the fees they charged for masses, was expressing a widespread view, to be found in Catharism and Waldensianism, only one step away from a wholesale scepticism about the doctrine of the mass⁷⁶. Margery Baxter, the trenchant fifteenth century Lollard from East Anglia expressed a stercoranism which resembles that of Jacques Autier⁷⁷. The materialist view of the sacrament, such as that expressed by John Morden of Chesham in the Chilterns to his son-in-law – “Thou art deceived, for it can nothing profit thee; for it is but bread and wine; and so it is when the priest began with it at mass, and so it is when the mass is ended” – is all the more striking in English Lollardy since it does not correspond to the Eucharistic views of its founder, John Wycliffe⁷⁸. A popular and crude scepticism took over and supplanted his teaching.

There is an obvious affinity between the Cathar and Lollard rejection of images and a striking, and plainly fortuitous likeness in Bogomil, Lollard and Cathar rejection of the veneration of the cross, condemned by adherents of all three movements as a gallows which should be hated. Examination of Peter Zwicker’s inquisition into Waldensian heretics in Brandenburg and Pomerania in the late fourteenth century reveals opinion familiar in other heresies, such as the belief that praying for the dead was no better than giving fodder to a dead horse or that rainwater was as good as holy water⁷⁹. John Fines believed that such pungent phrases were learned by rote in Lollard reading circles⁸⁰. Certainly heretical gatherings, Lollard or not, fostered these views; most likely, they prevailed simply because they were good *mots*, repeated at moments of irritation with the medieval Church, which might or might not lead deeper into organised heresy.

Cathars, Lollards and Waldensians all made use of popular scepticisms. Perhaps, nonetheless, it is unfair to use the term “made use of”. It is probable that

⁷⁵ John A. F. Thomson, *The Later Lollards 1414–1520* (Oxford 1965) 241–242, hereafter cited as *Thomson*; for cases of scepticism and eccentricity in England before Lollardy, *Lambert*, *Heresy*, 282.

⁷⁶ John Fines, *Heresy Trials in the Diocese of Coventry and Lichfield, 1511–12*, in: *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 14 (1963) 160–174, at 166.

⁷⁷ John Fines, *Studies in the Lollard Heresy* (unpublished Ph.D. thesis, University of Sheffield 1964) p. 67 n. 3. I am indebted to Dr Fines for use of his thesis.

⁷⁸ Thomson, 91. Anne Hudson, *The Premature Reformation. Wycliffite Texts and Lollard History* (Oxford 1988) 281–290; example of popular eucharistic heresy 195.

⁷⁹ Dietrich Kurze, *Zur Ketzergeschichte der Mark Brandenburg und Pommerns vornehmlich im 14. Jahrhundert*, in: *Jahrbuch für die Geschichte Mittel- und Ostdeutschlands* 16/17 (1968) 50–94.

⁸⁰ Reference as in n.76 (*supra*) at 167.

leaders and others in these movements were themselves early on influenced by casual scepticisms. There is much to be said for the view that a kind of humus existed, of anticlericalism, of scepticism on this or that point of doctrine, and of personal irritation, which made a growing-ground for heresy: it was then a matter of chance, personality, local tradition and of the *genus hereticum*, the phenomenon of the tainted family and its dependents, so well known to inquisitors and to agents of English bishops, which of the possible heretical plants was destined to grow up in the humus. Dupré-Theseider in his pioneer survey of the end of Catharism in Bologna was intrigued to notice how speedily Dolcinianism succeeded Catharism in the records of Bologna's inquisitors; a new, vital heresy, he observed, had taken over from an old and failing one, and, despite important differences shared with it an antipapalism and a notion of two rival Churches, the one Dolcinist, the other the Church of the perfect in utter rivalry to Catholicism. Was it, he asked, that the inquisitors turned immediately from the old heresy to the new, and more immediate peril, or did the new Joachimite vision in Dolcinianism attract numbers of former Cathars from the common humus of heresy to a new allegiance⁸¹? Subsequent research, revealing a distinction between the geographical origins of Dolcino's followers and the Cathars⁸², makes Dupré-Theseider's first hypothesis more probable than his second; but his notion of the heretical humus stands.

Lollardy and Waldensianism were at heart Scripturally based, reformist movements; Catharism was much less reformist in reality than they were and its doctrines diverged more profoundly from medieval orthodoxy. Some Waldensians were aware of this. Early Waldensians wanted to preach against Cathar heresy. The Waldensian deacon Raimond de Sainte-Foy, interrogated by Fournier, was prepared to accept the execution of Cathars who would not recant⁸³. The Cathars made use of the New Testament or a gospel as a vital accessory in their ritual, carried it with them and used it in preaching, but their mode of use is a far cry from the careful wrestling with the text characteristic of the preachings and readings of Lollards and Waldensians. Cathars handled the text externally, but in a solemn, distant and ritualistic manner and interpretation of it was always subject to the sovereign power of the perfect. It was not open to all to read and interpret. Catharism was profoundly clerical. No episode in Cathar history matches the ceremony on Easter Day in which William White, leader of the East Anglian Lollards, deliberately set one of his lay followers to celebrate the Eucharist though he was himself in priest's orders⁸⁴. He wished to show that he claimed for himself no other role at all than that of Scriptural teacher. In Catharism such a rite was inconceivable: the gulf between perfect and non-perfect was unbridgeable.

⁸¹ *Eugenio Dupré-Theseider*, *L'eresia a Bologna nei tempi di Dante*, in: *Id.*, *Mondo cittadino e movimenti ereticali nel medio evo* (Bologna 1978) 261–315, at 313.

⁸² *Raniero Orioli*, *Venit perfidus heresiarcha. Il movimento apostolico – dolciniano dal 1260 al 1307* (Rome 1988) 26. See *Paolini*, *L'eresia* (as in n.10 supra), p.81, n. 2.

⁸³ JF I 75.

⁸⁴ *Fasciculi Zizaniorum*, ed. W. W. Shirley, Rolls Series (London 1858) 423–24.

From a common humus of ethical protest and rationalist scepticism Cathar teachers carried their followers deeper into the dualism which lay at the heart of their movement. Catharism was the child of Byzantine and Balkan Bogomilism and shared with its parent the central tenet that creation was the work of Satan or of the evil principle, and that all matter was evil, with the consequences which flow from that for orthodox doctrines of Incarnation and Redemption and for the sacraments of the medieval Church. The hearers of the perfect learnt of the secrets of the transmigration of souls, of the battle between good and evil, of the fall of angels, of the evil creation and the making of men's bodies from mud by Satan and of the true understanding of marriage as intrinsically evil.

The myths had their own literary and psychological power, drawn from a rich and ancient storehouse⁸⁵. Fantasies brought colour to drab lives. Inventiveness in the perfect was prized. Some narrations, Gnostic in tone, have an erotic content in the mouths of strict celibates. It is as if a sexuality, firmly driven out of the front door, comes quietly in at the back. Transmigration of souls plainly struck a chord with some hearers. A mother mourning a lost family of four children was comforted by a believer with an interpretation of metempsychosis which assured her that the souls of her dead children would be reincarnated in the children she would have in the future⁸⁶. A simpler neophyte was pleased with the thought that she might once have been a queen⁸⁷. One has the impression that teachers and taught enjoyed their myths and that their taste for logic and scepticism had been exhausted by their attack on Catholicism. Here most emphatically Catharism diverged from the reformist movements.

Objections to dualism and the variegated myths were not commonly raised on grounds of logic or internal coherence or consistency with the text of Scripture. Guillaume Bélibaste baldly asserted that St Paul had passed through thirteen tunics, that is, he had been incarnated thirteen times before returning to heaven⁸⁸. This doctrine could only rest on the prophetic power of one perfect: it can have no other warrant. It seems never to have been challenged. Where personal feeling and experience were involved, it was different. Dualist attitudes to marriage, pregnancy and the salvation of children clearly repelled some women. Ermessende Viguiér of Cambiac when she was pregnant objected to being told by women perfect that she had a demon in her belly. Years later, in 1245 she took her revenge by informing on all the Cathars in her village⁸⁹. Sybille Peire of Arques, told by the per-

⁸⁵ *Malcolm Lambert, The Motives of the Cathars: Some Reflections*, in: *Religious Motivation: Biographical and Sociological Problems for the Church Historian*, ed. *Derek Baker*, *Studies in Church History* 15 (Oxford 1978) 45–59, at 53.

⁸⁶ JF I 203, 204.

⁸⁷ PG 190.

⁸⁸ JF III 175–6. Rottenwöhrer rehabilitates Bélibaste. He was a theologian with an individual viewpoint (RK IV (2) 369).

⁸⁹ MS 609 Bibl. Municipale de Toulouse, ff. 239v – 240v (inquisition of Bernard de Caux and Jean de Saint Pierre 1245–46; testimony of Ermessende). I owe reference and comment to the kindness of Professor W. L. Wakefield. On unborn children as demons, MS 609ff. 117v, Doat 12f. 57r (infm. of W. L. Wakefield). For modern comment and bibliography, *Malcolm Lam-*

fect Prades Tavernier not to give the breast to her sick infant, whom he had just consoled, declined his order and ceased to give sympathy to Catharism⁹⁰.

Pierre Maury is an example of an adherent who was inclined to ask too many questions. He was told not to put questions to other perfect by Pierre Autier, no doubt aware of the low standards of some of his team⁹¹, but he could not resist putting a homespun query to Jacques Autier while he instructed him on the fall of angels. Autier described how God the Father, noticing that angels were falling out of heaven through a hole, went and put his foot over it, then addressed the angels who had already fallen onto the earth below. Could the Father have been heard by the fallen angels after the hole had been stopped up, Pierre asked⁹²?

Maury was one of the few ready to put sceptical queries to a perfect relating dualist myths and cosmology. Most sat mutely by, entranced by gaily-coloured narratives, by good story-telling, appreciating eloquence, the gift of Pierre Autier, perhaps still more that of Jacques Autier who, his father said, with paternal pride, spoke like an angel⁹³. Though some dualism emerged in public preaching and discussion, especially in the days of freedom, and, for example, hints of Satan's evil creation were given early on through references to snakes, insects, toads and other unattractive creatures, there was a certain economy in Cathar exposition and secrets reserved for those more heavily committed. They by that time would have been practised in giving the melioramentum to the perfect on every meeting, the three-fold genuflection with formal exchanges between perfect and believer, locking them together in promise and hope, blessing from the perfect and from God, requested and given, with the implicit expectation of the adherent becoming one day a good Christian, that is, receiving the consolamentum.

The melioramentum acknowledged the authority of the perfect: it formed part of a structure of rite and practice, with every casual meeting and genuflection, the blessing of bread, the separation of perfect from believers at table, the segregation of cooking and eating utensils, the preaching and, above all, the consoling, serving to establish a sovereign power of the perfect, as a distinct race, over the lives and beliefs of their supporters⁹⁴. They surrendered to this sovereignty. So the nature of Cathar instruction and ritual helps to explain the otherwise odd coexistence of the sceptical and the frankly credulous, the marriage, as it were, between Voltaire and the Arabian Nights.

There was a deeper reason for acceptance of the variety of myths and explanations. Professor Rottenwöhrer reminds us that Cathars were not primarily interested in the classic question "unde malum?", and so were patient of a wide va-

bert, reviewing *Anne Brenon*, *Les femmes Cathares* (Paris 1992), in: *Cristianesimo nella storia* 15 (1994) 212–216.

⁹⁰ JF II 414–415, 424.

⁹¹ JF III 126.

⁹² JF III 131.

⁹³ *Jean Duvernoy*, *Le Catharisme: l'histoire des Cathares* (Toulouse 1977) 324. JF II, 406 ("loquebatur ore angelico").

⁹⁴ RK II (1) and (2) passim; PG 56–74.

riety of explanations of the origins of evil. Their prime interest lay in salvation⁹⁵. Their discussions were dominated by the question of God's people, which they identified with themselves and its fate. Christ came primarily to give knowledge of the consolamentum. They accepted that the world was evil; their concern lay in the means of escape and this they found in the perfect and the rite of consolamentum. Hence the supreme authority which they were happy for the perfect to wield.

An answer to the question: how far was Catharism a reform movement? must make a series of distinctions. Aspects certainly were reformist. Cathars took colour from their environment. They took up the concept of apostolic life, in vogue in the west in the twelfth century, and shared this concept with other evangelical movements: it was still a rallying-cry for them at its end, although they did not sustain a fervour for poverty as a constituent. Some Cathars borrowed from the Waldensians – ultimately, probably, via them from Arnold of Brescia – the belief that the Catholic Church had lost its authority at the time of the Donation of Constantine⁹⁶. This was a misleading view to hold since it was a fundamental tenet of Catharism that baptism by water, which went back to St John the Baptist, was instigated by Satan. The Church which the Cathars opposed had thus, in fact, in their view, forfeited its authority from the time of the New Testament. Cathars rejected killing and judgements of blood, on Scriptural grounds, and condemned the swearing of oaths, for the same reasons, and in accord with their fellow-dualists, the Bogomils, as we know from Euthymius Zigabenus in the early twelfth century⁹⁷.

Thus Catharism comprehended, together with its emphasis on Scripture, a series of tenets and practices which could fairly be called reformist, all held together by the teaching and personalities of the perfect, whose prestige and fascination long kept the movement in being.

Catharism was an eclectic religion, often lacking in internal coherence, and marked in Italy by major doctrinal conflicts which could not wholly be contained. Three main elements may be distinguished: firstly, an ethical strand, laying stress on the high moral life of the perfect; secondly, anticlericalism and scepticism, applied to the beliefs and practices of the Catholics; thirdly, dualism. The first two could, with some reservations, especially over the nature of the life of the perfect, fairly be called reformist; the third decidedly not, and the deeper a Cathar went into the dualist core of teaching, the more apparent it was that a great gulf existed between the core and simple reform. Pierre and Jacques Autier were explicit about the relationship between their Church and Catholicism. They intended to supplant the Catholic Church altogether. Talking to Sibille Peire and her husband,

⁹⁵ RK IV (3) 372–383 esp. 382; *Gerhard Rottenwöhrer*, *Unde Malum? Herkunft und Gestalt des Bösen nach heterodoxer Lehre von Markion bis zu den Katharern* (Bad Honnef 1986) 536–543.

⁹⁶ *Borst*, 215.

⁹⁷ *Op. cit.* 185–188; *Jean Duvernoy*, *Le Catharisme: la religion des Cathares* (Toulouse 1976) 189f.; *Obolensky*, 206–219.

they explained that the Catholic clergy lacked the understanding of good (the “*entendement de be*”, i.e., the dualist view of creation and the world) and would have to come to that understanding in other bodies, via the transmigration of souls. Even their good works were in vain: they were like a cow which gave milk, and then kicked over the pail⁹⁸.

In practice the degree of dualism of any member of the movement varied according to the level of contact with the perfect and the calibre of instruction. In the case of the long-term believer Bonigrino da Verona, exposed to more than one interrogation in his career, it was noticeable how much more doctrinally equipped he was than his fellow-believers after he left his usual haunts and stayed with the unbending dualists of Lake Garda⁹⁹. Two Florentine Cathars in their deposition of 1229 before the Abbot of San Miniato claimed that they had believed that their tenets, which they had abjured, described as Patarine, were Catholic; one of them added at the end of a list of doctrinal positions that there were many of them that he did not understand¹⁰⁰. Such muddled adherents were certainly not unique.

Most Cathars remained believers throughout their lives and did not receive the consolamentum till they were on their death-bed, and for many of them the reformist strands remained important, sometimes a good deal more important than the dualist, which they might only have assimilated very imperfectly. In all Cathar history there is a vital distinction between the long-term believer who worked closely with the perfect over years, protected, fed and listened to them, and the more casual adherent. Above all, we may suspect that it was the ethical strand, the high valuation of the life of the perfect, the respect and affection for their persons and their austerities which mattered most to the rank and file. That sentiment comes over unmistakably in the episode in which Blanche de Rodés confessed before Geoffrey D’Ablis’s deputy that she had been an intermediary between Pierre and Guillaume Autier and Esclarmonde d’en Garrabet, whom they wished to see again. It had become too dangerous. Esclarmonde explained that she had confessed to heresy and done penance. She could not see them any more; instead, as tokens of the affection in which she still held them, she sent them a container of wine, a gourmet bread called *tonhol* and raisins called *bromests* in a painted bowl¹⁰¹. So long as the perfect earned this kind of love, the movement they led would always be a menace to the Church.

⁹⁸ JF II 420.

⁹⁹ *Paolini*, *L’eresia*, 96–110.

¹⁰⁰ *Jean Guiraud*, *Histoire de l’Inquisition au moyen age II* (Paris 1938) 439, 456f.

¹⁰¹ PG 234.