

# A new method of proof of Filippov's theorem based on the viability theorem

Research Article

Sławomir Plaskacz<sup>1\*</sup>, Magdalena Wiśniewska<sup>1†</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Faculty of Mathematics and Computer Sciences, Nicholas Copernicus University, Chopina 12/18, 87-100 Toruń, Poland

Received 16 March 2012; accepted 2 May 2012

**Abstract:** Filippov's theorem implies that, given an absolutely continuous function  $y: [t_0, T] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$  and a set-valued map  $F(t, x)$  measurable in  $t$  and  $l(t)$ -Lipschitz in  $x$ , for any initial condition  $x_0$ , there exists a solution  $x(\cdot)$  to the differential inclusion  $x'(t) \in F(t, x(t))$  starting from  $x_0$  at the time  $t_0$  and satisfying the estimation

$$|x(t) - y(t)| \leq r(t) = |x_0 - y(t_0)| e^{\int_{t_0}^t l(s) ds} + \int_{t_0}^t \gamma(s) e^{\int_s^t l(\tau) d\tau} ds,$$

where the function  $\gamma(\cdot)$  is the estimation of  $\text{dist}(y'(t), F(t, y(t))) \leq \gamma(t)$ . Setting  $P(t) = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n : |x - y(t)| \leq r(t)\}$ , we may formulate the conclusion in Filippov's theorem as  $x(t) \in P(t)$ . We calculate the contingent derivative  $DP(t, x)(1)$  and verify the tangential condition  $F(t, x) \cap DP(t, x)(1) \neq \emptyset$ . It allows to obtain Filippov's theorem from a viability result for tubes.

**MSC:** 34A60, 34A12, 49J53, 93C15

**Keywords:** Lipschitz dependence on initial conditions • Viability for tubes • Contingent derivative  
© Versita Sp. z o.o.

We consider a Cauchy problem

$$\begin{cases} x'(t) \in F(t, x(t)), \\ x(t_0) = x_0. \end{cases} \quad (1)$$

\* E-mail: plaskacz@mat.umk.pl

† E-mail: madziadd@mat.umk.pl

We assume that the right hand side in (1) is a set-valued map  $F: [0, T] \times \mathbb{R}^d \rightsquigarrow \mathbb{R}^d$ , i.e.  $F(t, x) \subset \mathbb{R}^d$ , satisfying the following regularity conditions:

$$F(t, x) \text{ is compact convex for every } (t, x) \in [t_0, T] \times \mathbb{R}^d, \quad (2)$$

$$t \rightsquigarrow F(t, x) \text{ is measurable for every } x \in \mathbb{R}^d, \quad (3)$$

$$x \rightsquigarrow F(t, x) \text{ is } l(t)\text{-Lipschitz for almost all } t \in [t_0, T], \quad l \in L^1(t_0, T), \quad (4)$$

$$\|F(t, x)\| (= \sup\{|f| : f \in F(t, x)\}) \leq \mu(t), \quad \mu \text{ is integrable.} \quad (5)$$

(See [1, 2] for the definitions of measurability and continuity concepts of set-valued maps.)

We are interested in the existence of solutions to (1) satisfying constrains of the type  $x(t) \in P(t)$ , where  $P: [t_0, T] \rightsquigarrow \mathbb{R}^d$  is a set-valued map (we shall call it a tube). We say that the tube  $P$  is absolutely continuous if there exists an integrable function  $v \in L^1(t_0, T)$  such that  $d_H(P(t_1), P(t_2)) \leq \int_{t_1}^{t_2} v(s) ds$  for every  $t_1 < t_2$ , where  $d_H$  denotes the Hausdorff distance of sets.

Let  $K \subset \mathbb{R}^d$  be a nonempty subset and  $x \in K$ . Then the contingent cone to  $K$  at  $x$  is defined by

$$v \in T_K(x) \iff \text{there exist } h_n \rightarrow 0^+ \text{ and } x_n \in K \text{ such that } \frac{x_n - x}{h_n} \rightarrow v.$$

The contingent derivative  $DP(t, x)$  of  $P$  at  $(t, x) \in \text{Graph}(P)$  is defined as the set-valued map from  $\mathbb{R}$  to  $\mathbb{R}^d$  whose graph is described by

$$\text{Graph}(DP(t, x)) = T_{\text{Graph}(P)}(t, x).$$

It is not difficult to prove, using [2, Proposition 5.1.4], that

$$v \in DP(t, x)(1) \iff \text{there exist } h_n \rightarrow 0^+ \text{ and } x_n \in P(t + h_n) \text{ such that } \frac{x_n - x}{h_n} \rightarrow v.$$

We shall use the following viability result for tubes, see [4, Theorem 4.2].

### Theorem 1.

Assume that a closed valued tube  $P: [t_0, T] \rightsquigarrow \mathbb{R}^d$  is absolutely continuous and  $F: [0, T] \times \mathbb{R}^d \rightsquigarrow \mathbb{R}^d$  satisfies (2)–(5). If there exists  $A \subset [t_0, T]$  of full measure such that

$$\text{for all } t \in A \text{ and } x \in P(t), \quad F(t, x) \cap DP(t, x)(1) \neq \emptyset, \quad (6)$$

then for every  $x_0 \in P(t_0)$  there exists a solution to (1) such that  $x(t) \in P(t)$  for every  $t \in [t_0, T]$ .

We shall need some calculus formula for tubes.

### Lemma 2.

Suppose that a tube  $P$  is given by

$$P(t) = y(t) + r(t) \cdot K,$$

where  $y: [t_0, T] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$ ,  $r: [t_0, T] \rightarrow (0, +\infty)$  are absolutely continuous functions and  $K \subset \mathbb{R}^d$  is a nonempty compact set. Then there exists  $A \subset [t_0, T]$  of full measure such that for every  $t \in A$ ,  $x \in P(t)$  we have

$$DP(t, x)(1) = y'(t) + r'(t) \cdot k + r(t) \cdot T_K(k),$$

where  $x = y(t) + r(t) \cdot k$  and  $k \in K$ .

**Proof.** Fix  $t \in [t_0, T]$  such that derivatives  $y'(t), r'(t)$  exist.

( $\subseteq$ ) Let  $v \in DP(t, x)(1)$ . There exist  $h_n \rightarrow 0^+$  and  $x_n \in P(t + h_n)$  such that  $(x_n - x)/h_n \rightarrow v$ . Since  $x_n \in P(t + h_n)$  then  $x_n = y(t + h_n) + r(t + h_n)k_n$ , where  $k_n \in K$ . The set  $K$  is compact. Passing to a subsequence (denoted again by  $k_n$ ) we obtain that  $k_n \rightarrow a$  and  $a \in K$ . We have

$$y(t + h_n) = y(t) + h_n y'(t) + o_1(h_n), \quad r(t + h_n) = r(t) + h_n r'(t) + o_2(h_n),$$

where  $o_i(h_n)/h_n \rightarrow 0$  for  $i = 1, 2$ . So

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{x_n - x}{h_n} &= \frac{y(t + h_n) - y(t)}{h_n} + \frac{r(t + h_n)k_n - r(t)k}{h_n} = y'(t) + \frac{o_1(h_n)}{h_n} + \frac{(r(t) + r'(t)h_n + o_2(h_n))k_n - r(t)k}{h_n} \\ &= y'(t) + \frac{o_1(h_n)}{h_n} + r'(t)k_n + r(t) \frac{k_n - k}{h_n} + \frac{o_2(h_n)}{h_n} k_n. \end{aligned}$$

Thus the limit  $\lim (k_n - k)/h_n$  exists and equals to  $(v - y'(t) - r'(t)a)/r(t) = \omega \in T_K(k)$ . Moreover  $\lim k_n = k$ . We obtain that

$$v \in y'(t) + r'(t) \cdot k + r(t) \cdot T_K(k).$$

( $\supseteq$ ) Let  $v = y'(t) + r'(t) \cdot k + r(t)\omega$ , where  $\omega \in T_K(k)$ . There exist  $k_n \in K$  and  $h_n \rightarrow 0^+$  such that  $\omega = \lim (k_n - k)/h_n$ . So  $k_n = k + h_n\omega + o(h_n)$ , where  $o(h_n)/h_n \rightarrow 0$ . Setting  $x_n = y(t + h_n) + r(t + h_n)k_n$  we have

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{x_n - x}{h_n} &= \frac{y(t + h_n) + r(t + h_n)k_n - y(t) - r(t)k}{h_n} = \frac{y(t + h_n) - y(t)}{h_n} + \frac{r(t + h_n) - r(t)}{h_n} k + r(t + h_n)\omega + r(t + h_n) \frac{o(h_n)}{h_n} \\ &\rightarrow y'(t) + r'(t)k + r(t)\omega = v. \end{aligned}$$

Since  $\lim (x_n - x)/h_n \in DP(x, t)(1)$ , then  $v \in DP(t, x)(1)$ .  $\square$

We consider a special case  $K = K(0, 1) = \{x : |x| \leq 1\}$  and  $r(t) = |x_0 - y(t_0)| e^{\int_{t_0}^t l(s) ds} + \int_{t_0}^t \gamma(s) e^{\int_s^t l(\tau) d\tau} ds$ . We have  $r'(t) = l(t)r(t) + \gamma(t)$  for almost all  $t$ . Moreover,

$$T_K(k) = \begin{cases} \{\omega : \omega \cdot k \leq 0\} & \text{for } |k| = 1, \\ \mathbb{R}^n & \text{for } |k| < 1. \end{cases}$$

Let  $x = y(t) + r(t)k \in P(t)$ . If  $|k| < 1$  then  $DP(t, x)(1) = \mathbb{R}^d$ . If  $|k| = 1$  then using Lemma 2 we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} DP(t, x)(1) &= y'(t) + (l(t) \cdot r(t) + \gamma(t))k + r(t)T_K(k) = y'(t) + r(t)(l(t) \cdot k + T_K(k)) + \gamma(t)k \\ &= y'(t) + r(t)\{\omega : \langle \omega, k \rangle \leq l(t)\} + \gamma(t)k = y'(t) + \{\omega : \langle \omega, k \rangle \leq l(t) \cdot r(t) + \gamma(t)\}. \end{aligned}$$

Thus

$$DP(t, x)(1) = \begin{cases} y'(t) + \{\omega : \langle \omega, k \rangle \leq l(t) \cdot r(t) + \gamma(t)\} & \text{for } |k| = 1, \\ \mathbb{R}^d & \text{for } |k| < 1. \end{cases} \quad (7)$$

Now we recall Filippov's theorem, cf. [1, Theorem 2.4.1] and [3].

### Theorem 3.

If  $F : [0, T] \times \mathbb{R}^d \rightsquigarrow \mathbb{R}^d$  satisfies (2)–(5),  $x_0 \in \mathbb{R}^d$  and  $y : [t_0, T] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$  is an absolutely continuous function, then there exists a solution  $x : [t_0, T] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$  to (1) such that

$$|x(t) - y(t)| \leq |x_0 - y(t_0)| e^{\int_{t_0}^t l(s) ds} + \int_{t_0}^t \gamma(s) e^{\int_s^t l(\tau) d\tau} ds. \quad (8)$$

**Proof.** We set  $P(t) = y(t) + r(t)K(0, 1)$ , where

$$r(t) = |x_0 - y(t_0)| e^{\int_{t_0}^t l(s) ds} + \int_{t_0}^t \gamma(s) e^{\int_s^t l(\tau) d\tau} ds.$$

We have to verify the tangential condition (6). Fix  $t$  such that the derivatives  $y'(t)$ ,  $r'(t)$  exist and  $F(t, \cdot)$  is  $l(t)$ -Lipschitz. Let  $x = y(t) + r(t)k \in P(t)$  and  $|k| = 1$ . There exists  $w \in F(t, y(t))$  such that  $|y'(t) - w| = \gamma(t)$ . There exists  $v \in F(t, x)$  such that

$$|w - v| \leq d_H(F(t, y(t)), F(t, x)) \leq l(t)r(t).$$

We have

$$\langle v - y'(t), k \rangle = \langle (v - w) + (w - y'(t)), k \rangle \leq l(t)r(t) + \gamma(t).$$

So  $v \in DP(t, x)(1)$ . By Theorem 1, there exists a solution  $x(\cdot)$  to (1) such that  $x(t) \in P(t)$ , which implies the estimation (8).  $\square$

### Remark 1.

In the viability theorem we assume that the values of the set-valued map  $F(t, x)$  are convex. In Filippov's theorem this assumption is not necessary. Therefore the presented method of proof required stronger assumptions.

### Remark 2.

In [4, Theorem 4.2] we assume that the set-valued map  $F(t, \cdot)$  is continuous. We used in the proof of Filippov's theorem the assumption (4) ( $F(t, \cdot)$  is  $l(t)$ -Lipschitz) to obtain the tangential condition (6). The same arguments can be applied under a weaker assumption. Instead of (4) it is sufficient to assume that for all  $x, y \in \mathbb{R}^d$  and  $w \in F(t, y)$  there exists  $v \in F(t, x)$  such that  $\langle w - v, y - x \rangle \leq l(t)|y - x|^2$  for almost all  $t$ .

## References

- [1] Aubin J.-P., Cellina A., *Differential Inclusions*, Grundlehren Math. Wiss., 264, Springer, Berlin, 1984
- [2] Aubin J.-P., Frankowska H., *Set-Valued Analysis*, Systems Control Found. Appl., 2, Birkhäuser, Boston, 1990
- [3] Filippov A.F., Classical solutions of differential equations with multi-valued right-hand side, *SIAM J. Control*, 1967, 5(4), 609–621
- [4] Frankowska H., Plaskacz S., Rzeżuchowski T., Measurable viability theorems and the Hamilton–Jacobi–Bellman equation, *J. Differential Equations*, 1995, 116(2), 265–305